

# Request for Proposal Actuarial and Consulting Services for Pension Benefits

Boston Retirement System

September 12, 2022

**Boston Retirement System**  
**Boston City Hall, Room 816**  
**One City Hall Square**  
**Boston, MA 02201**

## Contents

|       |   |   |
|-------|---|---|
| 1.    | Public Notice of Procurement.....   | 1 |
| 1.1   | Introduction/Proposal Information and Conditions .....                                    | 2 |
| 1.1.1 | Technical Proposal.....   | 3 |
| 1.1.2 | Price Proposal .....  | 3 |
| 1.2   | Time for Filing Proposal.....   | 3 |
| 1.3   | Correction, Modification and Withdrawal of Proposals .....                                | 3 |
| 1.4   | Acceptance of the Proposal.....   | 3 |
| 1.5   | Basis for Acceptance/Conflict of Interest.....  | 3 |
| 1.6   | Required Format and Content of the Technical Proposal .....                               | 3 |
| 1.6.1 | Transmittal Letter .....  | 4 |
| 1.6.2 | Response to the Offeror Profile (Section 4).....  | 4 |
| 1.6.3 | Response to the Proposal for Actuarial and Consulting Services for Pension Benefits ..... | 4 |
| 1.6.4 | BRS Required Forms (Appendix A).....  | 4 |
| 1.6.5 | Minimum Evaluation Criteria (Appendix B).....   | 4 |
| 1.7   | Price Proposal (Appendix C .....  | 4 |
| 1.7.1 | Fixed Pricing.....  | 4 |
| 1.7.2 | Sealed Price Proposal.....  | 4 |
| 1.8   | Taxes.....  | 5 |
| 1.9   | Proposal Acceptance and Evaluation.....   | 5 |
| 1.10  | Offeror Qualifications.....   | 5 |
| 1.11  | Rejection of Proposals .....  | 5 |
| 1.12  | Agreement by Offeror.....   | 5 |
| 1.13  | RFP Includes by Reference All Documents Referred to and Included Therein .....            | 6 |
| 1.14  | Sole Provider.....  | 6 |
| 1.15  | Harmonious Labor Relations .....  | 6 |
| 1.16  | Timetable .....   | 6 |
| 2.    | Background.....   | 6 |
| 2.1   | Description of the BRS .....  | 6 |
| 3.    | Scope of Services.....  | 7 |
| 3.1   | General.....  | 7 |
| 4.    | Offeror Profile .....   | 8 |
| 4.1   | Organization Profile.....   | 8 |
| 4.2   | Role.....   | 9 |

|     |   |    |
|-----|---|----|
| 4.3 | References.....   | 9  |
| 4.4 | Performance.....  | 10 |
| 4.5 | Resources.....  | 10 |
| 5.  | Technical Proposal Submission.....                                      | 10 |
| 5.1 | General Requirements.....   | 10 |
| 5.2 | Independence.....   | 11 |
| 5.3 | Membership in a Professional Actuarial Organization.....                | 11 |
| 5.4 | Partner, Supervisory and Staff Qualifications and Experience.....       | 11 |
| 5.5 | Specific Valuation Approach.....  | 11 |
| 5.6 | Overview of Actuarial and Consulting Services for Pension Benefits..... | 11 |
| 5.7 | Approach to Problem Resolution.....                                     | 11 |
| 5.8 | Deadlines.....  | 11 |
| 6.  | Minimum Evaluation Criteria.....  | 12 |
| 6.1 | Overview.....   | 12 |
| 7.  | Comparative Evaluation Criteria.....                                    | 12 |
| 7.1 | Offeror’s Proposal.....   | 13 |
| 7.2 | Specific Valuation Approach.....  | 13 |
| 7.3 | Commitment to Deadlines.....  | 14 |
| 7.4 | Offeror Qualification and Experience.....                               | 14 |
| 7.5 | Failure to Perform.....   | 15 |
| 7.6 | Partner, Supervisory and Staff Qualifications and Experience.....       | 15 |
| 7.7 | Offeror References.....   | 15 |
| 8.  | Sealed Price Proposal.....  | 16 |
| 9.  | General Notice to Offerors.....   | 16 |
|     | APPENDICES.....   | 17 |
|     | Appendix A: Standard Boston Contract Forms.....                         | 18 |
|     | Appendix B: Minimum Evaluation Criteria.....                            | 19 |
|     | Appendix C: Pricing Form.....   | 21 |

**1. Public Notice of Procurement**

**ADVERTISEMENT  
BOSTON RETIREMENT SYSTEM**

The Boston Retirement System (“BRS”), hereby requests sealed proposals from interested and qualified actuary firms (“Offerors”) to provide actuarial and consulting services including, but not limited to providing a biennial valuation.

The BRS, acting by its Executive Director (“The Official”), requests proposals for the services described above, as particularly set forth in the Request for Proposals (RFP), which may be obtained on the Boston Retirement website <https://www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#request-for-proposals> or by emailing [Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov](mailto:Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov) on or after 9:00am, Boston Time, on Monday September 12, 2022. The RFP will remain available until the date and time of the opening of proposal, at Noon EST on September 26, 2022.

The attention of the proposers is directed to the provisions of the RFP and contract documents.

The BRS reserves the right to reject any and all proposals, or any part or parts thereof, and to award a contract as the Official deems to be in the best interests of the BRS. This contract shall be subject to funding by the Vote of the Boston Retirement Board. The maximum time for acceptance of a proposal and the issuance of a written notification of award shall be ninety (90) days. The award of this contract shall be subject to the approval of the five-member Boston Retirement Board.

Christine Weir  
Interim Executive Director

## 1.1 Introduction/Proposal Information and Conditions

All proposals shall be submitted in strict conformance with the Request for Proposal (RFP).

Proposals are to be submitted in hard copy and one submission electronically. All proposals must be received no later than Noon EST on September 26, 2022 in the Office of the Boston Retirement System, Boston City Hall Room 816, attention Ellen McCarthy, Comptroller. The electronic submission should be sent to [Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov](mailto:Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov).

No submissions will be accepted later than the time and date mentioned above. The RFP contains both price and technical evaluation criteria. Price and technical proposals shall be submitted separately. Under no circumstances shall any pricing information be included as part of any "Technical/Non-Price Proposal.

Each proposal submitted through hard-copy paper format must be submitted in two (2) separate sealed envelopes, one containing only Offeror information and marked "TECHNICAL/NON-PRICE PROPOSAL" and the other containing only price information and marked "PRICE PROPOSAL". Failure to submit separate proposals will result in rejection of the proposal. Please submit one (1) original and five (5) copies of the Proposal to:

Ellen McCarthy  
Boston Retirement System  
Boston City Hall – Room 816  
Boston, Massachusetts 02201

Please submit one (1) electronic submission of the Proposal to [Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov](mailto:Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov).

***The Official shall reject late proposals. Failure to submit separate sealed price and technical proposals shall result in disqualification of the entire proposal.***

The Official shall not open the proposals publicly, but shall open the Technical Proposals in the presence of one or more witnesses within twenty-four (24) hours of the above deadline for submission of proposals. The Official may open Price Proposals later and, in any case, shall open the Price Proposals to avoid disclosure to the individuals evaluating the Technical Proposals.

The term of the contract shall be for five (5) years. The Board reserves the right to extend this contract for an additional one (1) or two (2) years without further advertising. The contracts are subject to an annual performance review by the Board and its staff.

Submission of the proposal indicates acceptance by the Offeror of the conditions contained in this RFP, unless clearly and specifically noted in the proposal submitted and confirmed in the contract between the BRS and the Offeror selected.

The BRS reserves the right, where it may serve the BRS's best interest, to request additional information or clarification from Offerors, or to allow corrections of errors or omissions. At the discretion of the BRS, Offerors submitting proposals may be requested to make oral presentations as part of the evaluation process.

The BRS reserves the right to reject any and all proposals, or any part or parts thereof, and to award a contract as the Official deems to be in the best interests of the BRS. This contract shall be subject to funding by the Vote of the Boston Retirement Board. The maximum time for acceptance of a proposal and the issuance of a written notification of award shall be ninety (90) days. The award of this contract shall be subject to the approval of the five-member Boston Retirement Board.

**1.1.1 Technical Proposal**

The technical proposals **must** conform to the format, order and content set forth in Section 5 of this RFP. The technical proposal shall contain **absolutely no reference to price**.

**1.1.2 Price Proposal**

The proposal **must** conform to the format, order and content set forth in Section 8 of this RFP.

**1.2 Time for Filing Proposal**

Both the price and technical proposals shall be filed before the time and date designated in this RFP.

**1.3 Correction, Modification and Withdrawal of Proposals**

The Official shall unconditionally accept a proposal without alteration or correction, except as provided in this paragraph. An Offeror may correct, modify, or withdraw a proposal by written notice received in the office designated in the RFP prior to the time and date set for the submission of proposals. If a mistake in the intended proposal is clearly evident on the face of the proposal document, the Official shall correct the mistake to reflect the intended correct proposal and so notify the Offeror in writing, and the Offeror may not withdraw the proposal. An Offeror may withdraw a proposal, if a mistake is clearly evident on the face of the proposal document, but the intended correct proposal is not similarly evident. After the opening of technical proposals, an Offeror may not change the price or any other provision of the proposal in a manner prejudicial to the interests of the BRS or fair competition. The Official shall waive minor informalities or allow the Offeror to correct them.

**1.4 Acceptance of the Proposal**

The proposal will be firm for ninety (90) calendar days after the deadline for submission of proposals. Submission of the proposal indicates acceptance by the Offeror of the conditions contained in this RFP, unless clearly and specifically noted in the proposal submitted and confirmed in the contract between the BRS and the Offeror selected.

The BRS accepts no financial responsibility for costs incurred by any Offeror in responding to this RFP. Supporting technical manuals will be returned at the request of the Offeror. Otherwise, all responses and materials related to this RFP will become the property of the BRS following the contract award.

**1.5 Basis for Acceptance/Conflict of Interest**

Any proposal made will be accepted only on the basis that the Offeror, by filing its proposal, represents that it is made in good faith without fraud, collusion or connection of any kind with any other Offeror for the same work; that the Offeror is competing solely on its own behalf without connection, or with obligation to, any undisclosed person, firm or corporation; that no other person, firm or corporation has any interest in the contract; that no officer, agent or employee of the BRS is financially interested in the contract; that the Offeror is fully informed in regard to all provisions of the contract documents, including, without limitation, the specifications and drawings, if any; the time for performance and the provisions with respect to liquidated damages, bonds and insurance, if any. No proposal shall be deemed responsive unless an Offeror has certified and signed the statutorily required Contractor Certification included in the contract documents.

**1.6 Required Format and Content of the Technical Proposal**

Before submitting any proposals, Offerors shall fully understand all conditions pertaining to the RFP, and all required terms and conditions for carrying out the contract. By submitting a proposal, Offerors do thereby represent that they will adhere to all required terms and conditions of the contract. Any estimates, plans or other information relating to the goods, services, labor or materials or work required by the contract documents are to be considered for the purpose of comparing the several proposals. Neither the BRS, nor its Board, agents or employees, shall be responsible for the accuracy of, or bound by, such estimates, plans or information.

Proposals shall contain all completed forms defined as integral parts of this RFP. Additional materials may be referenced and then attached at the end as an Appendix.

Offerors must submit the entire proposal as instructed in Section 5 and as set forth in the sections below. The sources of information for the evaluation of proposals are as follows:

**1.6.1 Transmittal Letter**

A signed letter of transmittal briefly stating the Offeror's understanding of the work to be performed, the commitment to perform the work within the time period, a statement of qualifications as to why the Offeror believes itself to be the best qualified to perform the engagement and a statement that the proposal is a firm and irrevocable offer, good for the period of the engagement.

**1.6.2 Response to the Offeror Profile (Section 4)**

This section constitutes a description of the business and experience of the Offeror.

**1.6.3 Response to the Proposal for Actuarial and Consulting Services for Pension Benefits (Section 5)**

The proposal should provide responses to questions on the specific items requested in Section 5 of this RFP. Offerors are cautioned to ensure that all contract documents listed in Appendix A have signatures affixed, where required.

**1.6.4 BRS Required Forms (Appendix A)**

The Offeror will fully complete the forms listed in Appendix A "Standard Boston Contract," and return the signed forms with proposals. The Offeror may be asked to complete other required forms upon award.

**1.6.5 Minimum Evaluation Criteria (Appendix B)**

In order for a proposal to receive further consideration, an Offeror must unconditionally check "Yes" in response to each question set forth in Minimum Evaluation Criteria in Appendix B and the form must be signed by an authorized representative of the Offeror.

**1.7 Price Proposal (Appendix C)**

Price sheets must provide the precise level of detail requested on the form provided and must be signed by an authorized official of the Offeror. Offerors must ensure that the price forms and the workplan reconcile. *Reminder: This section is to be provided in the price submission section only. Under no circumstances shall any price information be included in the technical proposal.*

**1.7.1 Fixed Pricing**

*All rates/pricing shall be inclusive of time, materials and expense*, and any transitional cost shall constitute a not-to-exceed price of all goods and services. The proposed rates will be accepted by the BRS as fixed rates for the entire contract term.

**1.7.2 Sealed Price Proposal**

The Offeror shall respond to, and specify, an all-inclusive price for services specified and outlined in this RFP. Please refer to Section 8 of this RFP

## **1.8 Taxes**

Any taxes due will be assumed to be included in the Offeror's price of services. The BRS is exempt from sales taxes (Sales Tax Exemption No. 04-6244012). Exemption certificate will be provided, if requested, following award to the successful Offeror.

## **1.9 Proposal Acceptance and Evaluation**

The Official shall open sealed technical proposals in closed session, in the presence of one (1) or more witnesses at the time and date specified. The Official will examine each proposal to determine whether it meets all of proposal submission requirements. A "responsive" proposal is one that contains all of the forms and information services requested in the RFP. A "responsible" proposal is one that demonstrates the capability, integrity and reliability of the Offeror to perform under the contract to be awarded. *Any proposal which fails to include all of the information or documentation specified in the proposal submission requirements is non-responsive and will be rejected.*

The BRS reserves the right to include or substitute other staff in reference checks, and such staff may provide the Evaluation Committee with additional input into the evaluation. The Committee will evaluate the proposals and make recommendations.

The Evaluation Committee will evaluate the business and experience of the Offeror, and the Offeror's responses to questions on the specific tasks related to providing actuarial services to the BRS.

The Official will open the price proposals. The Official shall determine the most responsive and responsible proposals, taking into consideration the Evaluation Committee recommendation, any oral presentations or interviews and price.

The Official shall award the contract by written notice to the selected Offeror within the time specified in the RFP. The parties may extend the time for acceptance by mutual agreement.

A register of proposals with the name of each Offeror and the number of modifications to the proposal, if any, will be available for public inspection following the opening of technical proposals. However, the contents of the proposals shall remain confidential and will not be made available to the competing Offerors. Offerors wishing to review the contents of the winning proposal may do so only after the contract has been awarded.

## **1.10 Offeror Qualifications**

It is the purpose and intention of the Official not to award the contract to any Offeror who does not furnish evidence, when requested, satisfactory to the Official that it has the ability and experience to perform the pertinent class of work.

## **1.11 Rejection of Proposals**

The Official may cancel the RFP, or may reject in whole, any and all proposals or any parts thereof, if the Official determines that cancellation or rejections serves the best interests of the BRS. The Official reserves the right to waive any minor informality.

## **1.12 Agreement by Offeror**

The submission of a proposal shall constitute agreement on the part of the Offeror that, if the Offeror is given or mailed a notice of acceptance within ninety (90) days of the date for submission of proposals, the Offeror will, within ninety (90) calendar days (Saturdays, Sundays, and legal holidays excluded) or the

receipt of such notice or within such additional time as the Official may authorize in writing, deliver to the Official a contract properly executed, together with the required security for performance.

**1.13 RFP Includes by Reference All Documents Referred to and Included Therein**

This RFP hereby expressly incorporates by reference any and all documents referred to therein, including without limitation the Offeror Profile, the Scope of Services, and all contractual terms and conditions applicable to the procurement.

**1.14 Sole Provider**

The Contractor will be the prime vendor, with ultimate responsibility for the implementation and operation of all application components.

The Contractor will be required to assume responsibility for all items and services offered in its proposal, whether or not they produce or furnish them. Further, the BRS will consider the Contractor to be the sole point of contact with regard to Contractual matters, including payment of any and all charges resulting from the contract.

Any subcontractors and outside associates or consultants required by the Contractor in connection with the services covered by this contract shall be limited to such individuals or firms as were specifically identified and agreed to as part of the proposal. Any addition to or substitution of such subcontractors, associates or consultants shall be subject to prior written approval of the Official.

**1.15 Harmonious Labor Relations**

The submission of a proposal shall constitute the certification of the Offeror that it is able to and will furnish labor that can work in harmony with all elements of labor employed or to be employed on the work.

**1.16 Timetable**

|   |                             |
|---|-----------------------------|
| Request for Proposals Available*                | September 12, 2022          |
| Offeror’s Written Questions Due                 | Noon EST September 15, 2022 |
| BRS’ Response to Questions Provided by Offerors | September 21, 2022          |
| Deadline: Response of Proposals                 | Noon EST September 26, 2022 |
| Notice of Contract Award                        | October 20, 2022            |

\*Proposal available at <https://www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#request-for-proposals> or by email to [Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov](mailto:Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov)

**2. Background**

**2.1 Description of the BRS**

The Boston Retirement System (“BRS”) is a cost-sharing, multi-employer public employee retirement system and provides retirement benefits to all active and retired employees of the City of Boston, including Boston school teachers; the Boston Public Health Commission; the Boston Planning and Development Agency; the Boston Housing Authority; and the Boston Walter and Sewer Commission. The plan of benefits is established under Chapter 32 of the Massachusetts General Laws, covering all employees in

groups 1, 2, and 4, as defined in Chapter 32, as amended. In addition, to retirement benefits, there are disability benefits, both accidental and ordinary, and death benefits, provided through the plan.

The BRS is administered by a five-member Retirement Board. The Board is composed of two members elected by the participants; the City Auditor as ex-officio member; a fourth member appointed by the Mayor; and the fifth member selected by the other four members.

The provisions of the plan are set forth in Massachusetts General Laws, Chapter 32. The City has adopted Section 22 D of Chapter 32 of the Massachusetts General Laws making the City a funded system.

Active membership on December 31, 2021, was approximately 21,000 active members and approximately 15,500 retired members. The Annual Statement for the calendar year 2021, as submitted to the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission containing certain information which may be useful in preparing your proposal is on our website: [www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#financials-and-investments](http://www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#financials-and-investments), or may be obtained at the Retirement Board office.

The Boston Retirement System is presently funded under an approved funding schedule established as a result of the adoption of Chapter 32, Section 22D. The system has had previous actuarial valuations performed, had annual audited financial statements as well as an annual statement as required under Chapter 32. The most recent documents are available for review on our website: [www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#financials-and-investments](http://www.boston.gov/departments/retirement#financials-and-investments).

The Segal Co., based in Boston, MA has performed the last eleven valuations.

### **3. Scope of Services**

#### **3.1 General**

The BRS is seeking proposals to obtain the services of an actuary for the calendar years beginning 2023, 2024, 2025, 2026, 2027, with an option to renew these services for an additional one or two years, to prepare a biennial valuation of the pension plan for the following purposes:

- (1) To determine the financial condition of the plan at the end of the year.
- (2) To determine the recommended contribution for the ensuing fiscal years.
- (3) To prepare all necessary information required as set forth in Government Accounting Standards Board (GASB) and Financial Accounting Standards Board (FASB) and the funding schedule as required under section 22D of Chapter 32.

The firm selected shall prepare the following:

- (1) A complete biennial valuation for the plan years ending December 31, 2023, December 31, 2025, and December 31, 2027. The valuation will comply with all of the provisions required by the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission, Chapter 32, the Code of Massachusetts Regulations, the specific needs of the Boston Retirement System including a review of its existing established assumptions to determine whether any changes should be considered.
- (2) An update of the present funding schedule
- (3) Completion of the Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB) Statements No. 67 and 68 Accounting Valuation Report each December 31.
- (4) An annual review of the System to determine the potential impact to the Retirement System if the Board voted to increase the COLA base

In addition to the preparation of the biennial valuation and other responsibilities listed above, the successful bidder may be asked to perform additional services on a project by project basis, which will involve consulting services on the following:

- (1) Verification of the fiscal appropriation by the Public Employee Retirement Administration Commission.
- (2) Improvements in record-keeping.
- (3) Forecasting and liability modeling for the pension plan under various alternatives.
- (4) The firm will likely be required to provide information for City of Boston's June 30<sup>th</sup> financial statement for the respective five (5) fiscal years of 2023 through FY2027 and subsequent two years if the contract is extended beyond the initial five (5) years.

The biennial valuation shall contain but not be limited to the following information:

- (1) The annual cost of the system to fully fund the actuarial liability by June 30, 2027, as stipulated under Section 22D of Chapter 32 of the General Laws of Massachusetts for BRS and Boston School Teachers.
- (2) A draft report shall be prepared for review and comment by the Board before completion of the final report to be submitted to the Board and other governing bodies as so requested. The firm which is retained must make individuals available to meet at short notice with the Board and/or the Board's CPA firm, and representatives of the City of Boston's Office of the Chief Financial Officer, the Office of Budget Management, the City Auditor's office, the City's outside CPA firm, and other Employer's representatives.

The annual valuation shall contain but not be limited to the following

- (1) The annual cost and liabilities for each of the following separate departments/agencies within the Boston Retirement System:

Boston School Teachers  
 Boston Public Health Commission  
 Boston Planning and Development Agency  
 Boston Housing Authority  
 Water and Sewer Commission  
 City Employees  
 Retired Suffolk County Sheriff's Department  
 Retired Suffolk County Trial Court

For each of the above groups, the costs and liabilities must be presented separately, and a separate asset allocation must be prepared.

- (2) The report shall contain all information necessary for compliance by the City of Boston for each department/agency under GASB and FASB requirements.
- (3) A draft report shall be prepared for review and comment by the Board before completion of the final report to be submitted to the Board and other governing bodies as so requested. The firm which is retained must make individuals available to meet at short notice with the Board, and representatives of the City of Boston's Office of the Chief Financial Officer, the Office of Budget Management, the City Auditor's office, the City's outside CPA firm and other Employer's representatives

#### **4. Offeror Profile**

This section validates the proposal and constitutes a description of the business and experience of the Offeror.

##### **4.1 Organization Profile**

The Offeror must provide the following information:

1. Company name
2. Federal Identification Number
3. Home office address
4. Telephone
5. Address and telephone number of nearest support office
6. Name, telephone number and email address of contact person. This person must be capable of committing the Offeror to an agreement with the City
7. Number of years company has operated under this name
8. Year company was founded
9. Brief description of the nature of the company's business
10. Number of years company has been in present business

If Offeror is a corporation, state the following:

1. Where the company was incorporated
2. The names and addresses of all officers
3. Parent corporations
4. All subsidiaries

If Offeror is a partnership, state the name and address of all general and limited partners associated with the office responding to this RFP. The BRS reserves the right to require a complete list of all general and limited partners.

List all subcontractors who will be assigned to execute any work identified in the RFP. For each subcontractor who will be assigned to execute any portion of the work outlined in the Offeror's response, the following information must be provided:

1. Company name
2. Home office address
3. Telephone
4. Address and telephone of nearest support office
5. Number of years company has operated under this name
6. Year company was founded
7. Brief description of the nature of the company's business
8. Number of years company has been in present business
9. Type of business organization (i.e. corporation, partnership, etc.)

#### **4.2 Role**

Describe the Offeror's company's role in executing the scope of work identified in the RFP. Describe the roles of each subcontractor in executing the scope of work.

#### **4.3 References**

For the Offeror's office that will be assigned responsibility for the valuation, list the most significant engagements (to a maximum of six (6) performed in the last five (5) years that are substantially similar to the engagement described in this RFP. Indicate the following:

1. Client name
2. Scope of work
3. Date of engagement
4. Engagement partners assigned
5. Total hours required to complete the work described

As part of the evaluation of the proposals submitted, the Evaluation Committee reserves the right to contact any and all references provided by the Offeror in order to verify the successful performance and substantially similar work as noted by the Offeror.

List at least three (3) but no more than four (4) entities that have been clients of the Offeror in the last five (5) years that may be contacted as references. At least two of these must be public sector clients. The following information must be provided for each client:

1. Client name
2. Type of government/organization
3. Address
4. Contact name, title, email address and telephone
5. Date valuation was completed
6. Detailed description of work performed
7. Identify any project staff assigned to this client that is proposed to be assigned to the BRS' project

#### **4.4 Performance**

For the Offeror and all subcontractors provide the following:

1. Has the Offeror's company ever failed to complete any work awarded within the last five (5) years? If the answer is yes, state all circumstances.
2. Have any of the Offeror's Subcontractors ever failed to complete any work awarded within the last five (5) years? If the answer is yes, state all circumstances.

#### **4.5 Resources**

For the Offeror and all Subcontractors provide the following:

1. Total number of employees
2. Total number of employees assigned to local government Pension valuations
3. Location of the office from which work on this engagement is to be performed
4. Number and nature of the professional staff to be assigned to this engagement full time
5. Number and nature of the professional staff to be assigned to this engagement part time

### **5. Technical Proposal Submission**

#### **5.1 General Requirements**

The technical proposal should demonstrate the qualifications of the Offeror and of the particular staff to be assigned to this engagement. It should also specify a valuation approach that will meet the request for proposal requirements. As such, the substance of the proposals will carry more weight than their form or manner of presentation.

**THERE SHOULD BE NO DOLLAR UNITS OR TOTAL COSTS INCLUDED IN THE TECHNICAL PROPOSAL DOCUMENT.**

While additional data may be presented, the following Sections 5.2 through 5.5 must be addressed. The proposal should be prepared simply and economically, providing a straightforward, concise description of the Offeror's capabilities to satisfy the requirements of the request for proposals. The Evaluation Committee will use the Offeror's responses to forms and questionnaires including the Minimum Evaluation Criteria, the Scope of Work, and the Technical Proposal submission to judge the Offeror's responsiveness and responsibility to perform the work described in this request for proposals.

## **5.2 Independence**

The Offeror should provide an affirmative statement that it is independent of the Boston Retirement System, as defined by The Actuarial Standards Board. The Offeror should also list and describe the Offeror's professional relationships involving the Boston Retirement System or any of its agencies for the past five (5) years, together with a statement explaining why such relationships do not constitute a conflict of interest relative to performing the proposed actuarial and consulting services.

## **5.3 Membership in a Professional Actuarial Organization**

An affirmative statement should be included indicating that the Offeror and all assigned key professional staff are members in a professional actuarial organization (i.e. Fellow of the Society of Actuaries (FSA) or Associate of the Society of Actuaries (ASA) in Massachusetts and familiarity with Massachusetts General Laws regarding healthcare.).

## **5.4 Partner, Supervisory and Staff Qualifications and Experience**

Identify the engagement partner(s), manager(s), other supervisor(s), and staff members whom would be assigned to this engagement.

The Offeror should provide as much information as possible regarding the qualifications, experience and training, including relevant continuing professional education and certifications of the specific partners, managers, supervisors, specialists, and staff assigned to this engagement. The Offeror should also indicate how the quality of staff over the term of the agreement will be assured.

Engagement partners, managers, other supervisory staff and specialists may be changed if those personnel leave the firm, are promoted or are assigned to another office. These personnel may also be changed for other reasons with the express prior written permission of the Boston Retirement System. However, in either case, the Boston Retirement System retains the right to approve or reject replacements.

Other actuarial and consulting personnel may be changed at the discretion of the Offeror provided that replacements have substantially the same or better qualifications or experience.

## **5.5 Specific Valuation Approach**

The proposal should set forth a work plan, including an explanation of the valuation methodology to be followed, to perform the services required in Section 3, Scope of Services, of this request for proposals.

Offerors are required to provide the following information on their valuation approach:

1. Proposed segmentation of the engagement; and
2. Level of staff and number of hours to be assigned to each proposed segment of the engagement; and
3. Type and extent of analytical procedures to be used in the engagement and other related services not specified but are essential in providing a complete and accurate actuarial valuation; and
4. Detailed list of the required documentation to be provided by the BRS.

## **5.6 Overview of Actuarial and Consulting Services for Pension Benefits**

The proposal should describe the Offeror's approach to actuarial and consulting services as listed in the Scope of Services in Section 3.

## **5.7 Approach to Problem Resolution**

The proposal should include a description of the Offeror's approach to resolving problems that may arise during the course of this contract.

## **5.8 Deadlines**

Any changes to the full valuation reporting schedule outlined below must be agreed upon by both parties.

For Calendar Year ended December 31, 2023:  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2022.....April 30, 2023

For Calendar Year Ended December 31, 2024:  
Final Valuation for 1/1/2024.....April 30, 2024  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2023.....April 30, 2024

For Calendar Year ended December 31, 2025:  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2024.....April 30, 2025

For Calendar Year Ended December 31, 2026:  
Final Valuation for 1/1/2026.....April 30, 2026  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2025 .....April 30, 2026

For Calendar Year ended December 31, 2027:  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2026 .....April 30, 2027

Option Years:  
For Calendar Year ended December 31, 2028:  
Final Valuation for 1/1/2028.....April 30, 2028  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2027.....April 30, 2028

For Calendar Year ended December 31, 2029:  
Final GASB 67/68 Report as of 12/31/2028.....April 30, 2029

## **6. Minimum Evaluation Criteria**

### **6.1 Overview**

Minimum Evaluation Criteria (Appendix B) reflect those standards or attributes that the Official considers essential to the satisfactory performance of the contract. The Official will use the Minimum Evaluation Criteria to assist in identifying “responsive” proposals (those containing all required forms and information and offering all of the requested supplies or services in the RFP) and to identify Offerors who are “responsible”, i.e. who possess the capability, integrity, and reliability to perform under the contract.

The BRS will evaluate each proposal to determine whether it meets all Minimum Evaluation Criteria. ***Note: Only those proposals for which an authorized representative of the Offeror has unconditionally checked “Yes” for each of the requirements set forth in this section will be accepted for further evaluation.***

## **7. Comparative Evaluation Criteria**

Only proposals determined by the Official to meet all Minimum Evaluation Criteria, and not to be otherwise legally responsible, shall be evaluated pursuant to the Comparative Evaluation Criteria below. An evaluation committee designated by the Official shall prepare written evaluations for each responsive proposal. The evaluation committee shall assign a rating of “highly advantageous”, “advantageous”, or “unacceptable” to each criterion.

The BRS will apply Comparative Evaluation Criteria in deciding which proposal to select from among those that meet the Minimum Evaluation Criteria. Ratings for each criterion will be assigned based on documentation provided by Offerors in response to information requested in the section Nature of

Services Provided and the section Required Content and Format of Technical Proposal and as otherwise described below. The purpose of information requested in this section is to assist the BRS in evaluating the Offeror's overall qualifications, including its methodologies and previous experience.

## 7.1 Offeror's Proposal

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposed actuarial services, valuation approach, including the work plan and valuation methodology, in the judgment of the Evaluation Committee, are of excellent quality. Excellent quality shall be those proposals that contain highly-defined processes and explanations, and do not contain any ambiguous language for the reviewers.

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposed actuarial services, valuation approach, including the work plan and valuation methodology, in the judgment of the Evaluation Committee, are of good quality. Good quality shall be those proposals that contain adequately defined processes and/or language, but may require additional questions from the reviewers.

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposed actuarial services, valuation approach, including the work plan and valuation methodology, in the judgment of the Evaluation Committee, are of poor quality. Poor quality shall be those proposals that do not provide adequately defined processes and language, and do not provide the reviewers with a clear statement of the scope of work to be performed and the methods used.

## 7.2 Specific Valuation Approach

This section will rate the Offeror based on the work plan valuation approach and commitment to providing the requirements outlined in the Scope of Services and Delivered Product. Excellent quality is defined as a highly-defined process and explanation, and does not contain any ambiguous language for the reviewers. Good quality is defined as an adequately defined process, but may require additional questions from the reviewers.

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, includes:

- ◆ an excellent quality work plan and timeline;
- ◆ an excellent description of the analytical procedures to be used during the engagement; and
- ◆ an excellent description of the delivered product.

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, includes:

- ◆ a good quality work plan and timeline;
- ◆ a good quality description of the analytical procedures to be used during the engagement; and
- ◆ a good description of the delivered product.

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, does not include one of the following:

- ◆ a work plan and timeline;
- ◆ a description of the analytical procedures to be used during the engagement; or
- ◆ a description of the delivered product.

### 7.3 Commitment to Deadlines

This section will rate the Offeror based on level of staff and number of hours to be assigned, ability to meet the reporting requirements, and ability to attend meetings at the Boston Retirement System Office.

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, includes:

- ◆ appropriate staffing levels; and
- ◆ specific number of hours committed to complete each segmentation of the valuation; and
- ◆ a high commitment to meeting the reporting requirements as outlined in Scope of Services and Delivered Product; and
- ◆ a high commitment to attend scheduled meetings at Boston Retirement System Office.

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, includes:

- ◆ appropriate staffing levels; and
- ◆ number of hours committed to complete the valuation; and
- ◆ a commitment to meeting the reporting requirements as outlined in Scope of Services and Delivered Product; and
- ◆ a commitment to attend scheduled meetings at Boston Retirement System Office.

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose proposal, as determined by the evaluation committee, does not include one of the following:

- ◆ appropriate staffing levels; or
- ◆ number of hours committed to complete the valuation; or
- ◆ a commitment to meeting the reporting requirements as outlined in Scope of Services or Delivered Product; or
- ◆ a commitment to attend scheduled meetings at Boston Retirement System Office.

### 7.4 Offeror Qualification and Experience

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror demonstrating more than seven (7) years of verifiable experience successfully providing goods and/or services to public sector client(s) similar in size and organization to the BRS for work substantially similar to the work described in this RFP;

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror demonstrating more than five (5) and up to seven (7) years of verifiable experience successfully providing goods and/or services to public sector client(s) similar in size and organization to the BRS for work substantially similar to the work described in this RFP;

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror demonstrating less than five (5) years of verifiable experience successfully providing goods and/or services to public sector client(s) similar in size and organization to the BRS for work substantially similar to the work described in this RFP.

### 7.5 Failure to Perform

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose company has **never** failed to complete any work awarded, **and has not** had any adverse legal judgments against its actuarial performance within the past five years;

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose company has failed to complete any work awarded **one time** in the last five years, **and has not** had an adverse legal judgments against its actuarial performance within the past five years;

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose company has failed to complete any work awarded **two or more times** in the last five years, **and/or has** had an adverse legal judgments against its actuarial performance within the past five years.

### 7.6 Partner, Supervisory and Staff Qualifications and Experience

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror that commits in its proposal to assign a person in a significant leadership role (manager/partner) for the duration of this project, who possesses more than seven (7) years of professional experience successfully managing projects of similar size, scope and type as the project described in this RFP. The manager/partner and supervisor assigned to this project possess membership in a professional organization relevant to the performance of the valuation such as Fellow of the Society of Actuaries or Associate of the Society of Actuaries in Massachusetts;

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror that commits in its proposal to assign a person in a significant leadership role, for the duration of this project, who possesses between five (5) and seven (7) years of professional experience successfully managing projects of similar size, scope and type as the project described in this RFP. The manager/partner and supervisor assigned to this project possess membership in a professional organization relevant to the performance of the valuation such as Fellow of the Society of Actuaries or Associate of the Society of Actuaries in Massachusetts.

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror that commits in its proposal to assign any personnel who possesses less than five (5) years of professional experience successfully managing projects of similar size, scope and type as the project described in this RFP; or any manager, partner or supervisor that is not a member in a professional organization relevant to the performance of the valuation such as - Fellow of the Society of Actuaries or Associate of the Society of Actuaries in Massachusetts-.

### 7.7 Offeror References

A rating of Highly Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose references, for successfully providing services substantially similar to the work described in this RFP, report that they are **very satisfied** with the Offeror's performance of this work;

A rating of Advantageous shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose references, for successfully providing services substantially similar to the work described in this RFP, report that they are **satisfied** with the Offeror's performance of this work;

A rating of Unacceptable shall be assigned for this category to an Offeror whose references, for successfully providing services substantially similar to the work described in this RFP, report that they are **dissatisfied** with the Offeror's performance of this work.

## **8. Sealed Price Proposal**

The sealed price proposal should contain a flat rate for all services relative to performing the actuarial and consulting engagement as described in this request for proposals. The total all-inclusive price to be proposed is to contain all direct and indirect costs including all out-of-pocket expenses.

The BRS will not be responsible for expenses incurred in preparing and submitting the sealed price proposal. Such costs should not be included in the price proposal.

The sealed price proposal sheet should include the following information:

- A. Name of Offeror; and
- B. Certification that the person signing the proposal is entitled to represent the Offeror; and is empowered to submit the proposal and authorized to sign a contract with the BRS; and
- C. A fixed price per year consistent with actuarial valuation standards at this time for the FY2023 through FY2029 reviews. Option year prices to be included in pricing.

## **9. General Notice to Offerors**

All questions as to the interpretation of the RFP must be submitted in writing to:

Ellen McCarthy  
Boston Retirement S  
Boston City Hall – Room 816  
Boston, Massachusetts 02201  
or e-mail questions to: [Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov](mailto:Ellen.McCarthy@boston.gov)

The BRS will not respond to oral questions regarding this RFP. Only written questions submitted by Noon EST Thursday September 15, 2022 will be accepted. Written answers to questions shall be sent to each Offeror no later than Wednesday September 21, 2022. The BRS shall not respond to any communications which are not submitted in writing to the address above and are not submitted by the date specified.

The Boston Retirement Board will select an Offeror based upon the recommendation of the evaluation committee selected by the Official.

Submission of a proposal indicates acceptance by the Offeror of the conditions contained in this RFP, unless clearly and specifically noted in the proposal submitted and confirmed in the contract between Boston Retirement System and the Offeror selected.

## APPENDICES

## Appendix A: Standard Boston Contract Forms

### 1. Instructions for completing Boston Standard Contract Forms:

#### **Form CM10-11: Standard Contract**

Please complete Contractor's Name and Address, FIN and sign the section indicated for Contractor.

#### **Form CM06: Certificate of Authority (For Corporations Only)**

Please complete the entire form and sign.

#### **Form CM09: Contractor Certification**

Section A will be completed describing the work to be performed. Please complete all other sections and sign on page 3.

#### **Forms CM15A-B: CORI**

Form CM15B CORI Compliance Standards provides the Offeror information needed to complete form CM15A. Form CM15A must be completed and signed.

#### **Living Wage Forms 2 & 8**

Only LW02 – Covered Vendors Living Wage Agreement and LW08 – Vendors Living Wage Affidavit are required to be returned with the RFP.

#### **Form CM16: Wage Theft Prevention**

Please complete the entire form and sign.

## Appendix B: Minimum Evaluation Criteria

### 1. Instructions

In order for a proposal to receive further consideration, an Offeror must unconditionally check “Yes” in response to each question below. The BRS shall reject in its entirety the proposal of any Offeror who refuses or fails to check “Yes” to each question below, or who checks “Yes” but attempts to modify, qualify or limit its affirmative response. The Offeror shall also attach to its proposal any and all information and/or documentation requested in this section of the RFP. The Offeror's authorized representative shall sign on the line provided following the last Minimum Evaluation Criterion.

1. Was the Offeror’s proposal delivered to the BRS prior to the deadline for receipt of proposals and in accordance with the instructions in the Public Notice?  
 Yes  No
2. Does the Offeror’s proposal conform to the RFP in all respects?  
 Yes  No
3. Does the Offeror’s proposal include full and complete responses to Section 5 titled Technical Proposal Submission?  
 Yes  No
4. Has an authorized representative of the Offeror signed the proposal and Minimum Evaluation Criteria where required?  
 Yes  No
5. Did the Offeror submit separate, sealed price and technical proposals as required by law and this RFP?  
 Yes  No
6. Has the Offeror provided at least three (3) references; two of which are public sector clients where the engagement was substantially similar to the work requested in this request for proposals?  
 Yes  No
7. Has the Offeror been in business for a minimum of five (5) years?  
 Yes  No
8. Did the Offeror provide an affirmative statement that it is independent of the Boston Retirement System, as defined by The Actuarial Standards Board?  
 Yes  No
9. Did the Offeror provide statement of disclosure for failure to perform as described in the Offeror’s Performance section?  
 Yes  No

**2. Signature**

The Offeror's authorized representative shall sign on the line provided here, certifying that the responses provided by the Offeror to these Minimum Evaluation Criteria are provided without modification, qualification, or limit.

SIGNED UNDER THE PAINS AND PENALTIES OF PERJURY

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Title

\_\_\_\_\_  
Company Name

\_\_\_\_\_

**Appendix C: Pricing Form**

**1. Refer to Section 8 for completion instructions. Sealed Price Proposal Form is located below.**

The proposed rates will be accepted by the BRS as fixed rates for the entire contract term.

| Price Proposal for Boston Retirement System Actuarial Services |          |         |      |      |      |      |      |              |      |       |
|--|----------|---------|------|------|------|------|------|--------------|------|-------|
| Offeror Name:  |          |         |      |      |      |      |      |              |      |       |
| All Inclusive Price - Specified Services                       | Budgeted | Blended | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 | 2026 | 2027 | Option Years |      | Total |
|  | Hours    | Rates   |      |      |      |      |      | 2028         | 2029 |       |
| Biennial Valuation 1/1/2024, 1/1/2026, 1/1/2028                |          |         |      |      |      |      |      |              |      | 0     |
| Annual GASB 67/68 Report 12/31/2022-12/31/2028                 |          |         |      |      |      |      |      |              |      | 0     |
| Management Advisory Services - as needed hourly rate           |          |         |      |      |      |      |      |              |      | 0     |
| <b>Total</b>   | 0        | 0       | \$0  | \$0  | \$0  | \$0  | \$0  | \$0          | \$0  | \$0   |

The Offeror’s authorized representative shall sign on the line provided here, certifying that the responses provided by the Offeror on this Sealed Price Proposal Form are provided without modification, qualification, or limit.

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

\_\_\_\_\_  
Printed Name

\_\_\_\_\_  
Title

\_\_\_\_\_  
Company