

;
; 11/29/18 12:31 AM
;
;;;Boston City Council A 181129

>> COUNCILLOR WU IS THE SPONSOR OF THIS.

I ALSO WANT TO REMIND YOU THAT THIS PUBLIC HEARING IS BEING RECORDED IN BROADCAST LIVE ON CHANNELS COMCAST 8, RCN 82 AND VERIZON 1964 AND WEBCAST ON BOSTON.GOV/CITYCOUNTRY/TV. PLEASE SILENCE YOUR CELL PHONES AND OTHER DEVICES.

WE WILL ALSO TAKE PUBLIC TESTIMONY AND WOULD APPRECIATE IT IF YOU SIGN IN TO TESTIFY.

AT THE START OF THE TESTIMONY, PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME, ADDRESS AND AFFILIATION.

TODAY'S HEARING IS ON DOCKET 1420.

THIS MATTER IS SPONSORED BY COUNCILLOR MICHELLE WU AND REFERRED TO THE COMMITTEE ON PLANNING, DEVELOPMENT AND TRANSPORTATION.

IT'S AN ORDER FOR A HEARING INVOLVING IMPLEMENTATION, A ONE-CARD MUNICIPAL IDENTIFICATION PROGRAM IN THE CITY OF BOSTON.

I WANT TO THANK COUNCILLOR WU ON THIS HEARING AND MAYOR WALSH FOR HIS LEADERSHIP.

I LOOK FORWARD TO THIS CONVERSATION TODAY REGARDING THE MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM AND WHAT STEPS WE NEED TO LOOK AT MOVING FORWARD.

A CITY OF BOSTON STUDY INDICATED THAT MORE THAN 140,000 OF OUR RESIDENTS ENCOUNTER DIFFICULTIES DUE TO LACK OF IDENTIFICATION.

1/5 OF OUR RESIDENTS MAY HAVE TROUBLE OPENING AN ACCOUNT AT A FINANCIAL INSTITUTION, CASHING A CHECK, USING A CREDIT CARD A PLYING FOR A JOB, ASSESSING A BUILDING.

THIS ISSUE HAS A SIGNIFICANT

IMPACT ALSO ON OUR HOMELESS COMMUNITY, TRANS-GENDER COMMUNITY AND IMMIGRANT COMMUNITY.

THERE MAY BE INCENTIVES OR BENEFITS THAT COME WITH HAVING A MUNICIPAL I.D., AS ALWAYS THE ABILITY TO STREAMLINE SERVICES EFFICIENTLY.

MOREOVER, OTHER CITIES HAVE IMPLEMENTED THIS SUCH AS NEW HAVEN, SAN FRANCISCO, NEW YORK AND WASHINGTON HAVE SIMILAR PROGRAMS.

I ALSO UNDERSTAND THAT THERE ARE CONCERNS ABOUT MISUSE AS WELL AS VARIOUS OFFICIALS HAVING ACCESS TO PARTS OF THE DATA FROM THE CARD THAT MAY NOT BE RELEVANT. AGAIN, I LOOK FORWARD TO HEARING FROM YOU ON HOW WE CAN WORK ON THIS ISSUE TOGETHER.

AT THIS TIME, I WOULD LIKE TO ASK THE COUNCILLORS PRESENT IF THEY WOULD LIKE TO MAKE AN OPENING STATEMENT BEGINNING WITH COUNCILLOR WU.

>> THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

I REALLY APPRECIATE YOU MAKING TIME FOR THIS HEARING.

WE HAVE JAM PACKED COUNCILLOR CALENDAR, SO I KNOW, FOR EXAMPLE, CHIEF MARTY MARTINEZ WANTED TO BE HERE BUT HAD A TIME CONFLICT AND OTHERS.

SO I APPRECIATE YOU STEPPING IN AND SHARING THE DETAILED KNOWLEDGE OF THE FEASIBILITY STUDY RESULTS.

AGAIN, I WANTED TO SEEK AN UPDATE ON THE PROCESS BECAUSE THE COUNCIL AND THE ADMINISTRATION HAVE BEEN HAVING THIS CONVERSATION FOR OVER THREE YEARS NOW.

THE DYNAMIC OBVIOUSLY HAS CHANGED WITH THE FEDERAL ELECTION IN BETWEEN.

BUT THE ORIGINAL INTENT REMAINS THE SAME, TO MAKE SURE THE CITY OF BOSTON IS AS WELCOMING AND INCLUSIVE A CITY AS POSSIBLE FOR RESIDENTS OF ANY BACKGROUND AND HAVING SEEN THAT IN OTHER

CITIES, A MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM HELPS REDUCE AND ELIMINATE THAT GAP, THE BARRIER FOR COMMUNITIES WHO ARE -- WHO FIND IT DIFFICULT TO ACCESS FORMAL GOVERNMENT ISSUED I.D., PARTICULARLY WHEN IT COMES TO HOUSING STATUS AND THOSE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS WHEN IT COMES TO IMMIGRATION STATUS AND THOSE WHO MAY BE UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS. WHEN IT COMES TO GENDER IDENTITY AND OUR NEIGHBORS AND FRIENDS AND RESIDENTS IN THE TRANS COMMUNITY. BECAUSE OF THE NATIONAL POLITICAL CONTEXT, ANY PROGRAM LIKE THIS WHICH SEEKS TO ELIMINATE SOME OF THE BARRIERS MUST IN ITS FIRST MOST IMPORTANT STEP MAKE SURE THAT IT IS SECURE AND SAFE AND NOT AT ALL HARMING AND PUTTING AT RISK SOME OF THE RESIDENTS THAT OUR COMMUNITIES THAT I MENTIONED. WE HAVE SEEN OTHER CITIES DO THIS WHEN IT'S SOLD AS A CULTURAL AMENITY AND CONVENIENCE FOR PEOPLE. THAT ONE CARD GETS YOU A YEAR'S MEMBERSHIP AT THE MUSEUM OR THE AQUARIUM OR BIKE SHARE SYSTEM. WHEN IT ALSO IS YOUR TAP CARD FOR THE MBTA AND THE LIBRARY CARD AND YOUR STUDENT I.D. SO I'M GRATEFUL TO THE ADMINISTRATION FOR TAKING IT THIS FAR, HAVING ALLOCATED FUNDING FOR THE FEASIBILITY STUDY AND NOW COMPLETED IT AND REPORTING BACK TO US. LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING MORE ABOUT WHAT THE FINDINGS ARE. THANK YOU TO MR. CHAIRMAN AND ALL OF MY COLLEAGUES FOR BEING HERE.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILLOR WU. I'D LIKE TO ACKNOWLEDGE CITY COUNCIL McCARTHY AS PRESENT AND COUNCILLOR CIOMMO, WOULD YOU LIKE TO PROVIDE AN OPENING STATEMENT?
I DIDN'T SEE HIM.
OKAY.

>> I'M OLDER.

[LAUGHTER]

NO, I THINK THIS IS -- THE TIME HAS COME TO LOOK AT THIS, BUT I'M ALWAYS GOING TO ASK THE QUESTIONS ABOUT THE FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS OF IMPLEMENTING THESE PROGRAMS AND THE OVERSIGHT AND SUCH.

YOU KNOW, THE STATE OBVIOUSLY ISSUES IDENTIFICATION CARDS AND THAT'S PART OF WHAT THEY DO.

THIS WOULD BE A WHOLE NEW SERVICE THAT WE PROVIDE.

I THINK IT'S WORTHY THAT WE DO GIVE OUT LIBRARY CARDS.

WE NEED TO ALWAYS BE MINDFUL OF THE COST TO THE CITY, TO THE TREASURY, TO THE TAXPAYERS.

WHEN WE IMPLEMENT THINGS LIKE THIS, SOMETIMES IT MAY BE AT THE COST OF OTHER SERVICES AND PROGRAMS TO THE CITY.

I LOOK FORWARD TO THE CONVERSATION.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILLOR CIOMMO. COUNCILLOR ZAKIM?

>> THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

I WANT TO THANK COUNCILLOR WU FOR CONTINUING HER REFERENCE ON THIS.

I'M SURPRISED -- NOT THAT SURPRISED BUT INTERESTING TO SEE HOW LONG THIS DISCUSSION HAS BEEN ONGOING AND IT'S IMPORTANT THAT WE KEEP DOING IT AND ACKNOWLEDGING THE POLITICAL REALITIES THAT HAVE SHIFTED ON A NATIONAL SCALE.

IT'S IMPORTANT.

I'M INTERESTED IN HEARING -- I BELIEVE NEW YORK AND WE HAD A REMOTE TESTIMONY FROM THE INDIVIDUAL WHO RUNS NEW YORK'S PROGRAM TWO YEARS AGO IN THIS CHAMBER, HOW THEY HAVE ADDRESSED ISSUES AROUND PRIVACY, WORKING WITH MASS DOT.

I KNOW THEY HAVE AN ISSUE THAT NEEDS TO BE RESOLVED BY THE GOVERNOR AROUND ISSUING DRIVERS LICENSES AND IDENTIFICATION TO OTHER UNDOCUMENTED PEOPLE. ANY CARD THE CITY OF BOSTON HAS,

THERE'S NO REASON THEY COULDN'T HAVE A T PASS ON IT, NO REASON IT COULDN'T BE A LIBRARY CARD OR ANYBODY ELSE THE CITY DOES. I'M INTERESTED IN SEEING HOW WE CAN DO THAT.

I KNOW THAT THERE ARE OTHER CITIES THAT HAVE CONVERSATIONS WITH OFFICIALS, CAMBRIDGE AND THE IMMEDIATE AREA THAT WOULD BE INTERESTING IN PARTNERING WITH US ON THIS TO ADDRESS SOME CONCERNS PERHAPS AROUND COST SAVINGS AND ECONOMIES OF SCALE.

I WANT TO MAKE SURE WE'RE ADDRESSING THAT.

WE ARE ALSO DOING EVERYTHING WE CAN TO MAKE THIS IDEA STRONG AS IT CAN SO IT'S VALID FOR PEOPLE WHO ARE, YOU KNOW, TRYING TO ENTER BUILDINGS OR FOR BANKING PURPOSES OR THINGS THAT WE NEED TO DO.

OBVIOUSLY THE CITY'S AUTHORITY MAY BE LIMITED ON THAT, BUT WE NEED TO MAKE IT AS USEFUL AS POSSIBLE.

WE NEED TO DO THIS.

CERTAINLY THE STATE IS NOT MOVING ON THIS IN MASSACHUSETTS AND OBVIOUSLY THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT IS NOT DOING ANYTHING CONSTRUCTIVE ON THIS FRONT WHATSOEVER OR ANY FRONT WHATSOEVER THESE DAYS.

LOOKING FORWARD TO HEARING WHERE WE ARE ON THIS AND THANK YOU FOR THIS AND THANK YOU,

MR. CHAIRMAN, FOR SCHEDULING THIS AND FITTING IN WITH OUR CRAMMED AGENDA THESE DAYS.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILLOR ZAKIM. COUNCILLOR McCARTHY.

AT THIS TIME I WOULD LIKE TO RECOGNIZE ANDRE LIMA, DIRECTOR OF POLICY AND RESEARCH, MAYOR'S OFFICE OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES.

MR. LIMA, THANKS FOR BEING HERE.

>> THANK YOU, CHAIRMAN FLYNN, COUNCILLOR WU, OTHER MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL.

THANKS FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY TO SPEAK ABOUT DOCKET NUMBER 1420

AND PROVIDE AN UPDATE ON THE MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM, SPECIFICALLY THE MUNICIPAL I.D. FEASIBILITY STUDY.

AGAIN, MY NAME IS ANDRE LIMA FOR THE MAYOR'S OFFICE OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES AND HERE TO TESTIFY ON BEHALF OF MARTY MARTINEZ.

COUNCILLORS FLYNN AND WU DID A TREMENDOUS JOB ALREADY OF SUMMARIZING, GIVING AN OVERVIEW OF WHAT MUNICIPAL I.D. CARDS ARE, BUT I'LL JUST CONTINUE THAT PRIMER BY SAYING -- KIND OF DEFINING THE PROGRAMS FOR THE COUNCIL.

MUNICIPAL IDENTIFICATION CARD OR CARD PROGRAM IS SIMPLY A FORM OF IDENTIFICATION OR IDENTIFICATION CARD MUNICIPAL BY A MUNICIPALITY BY A CITY RATHER THAN A STATE OR FEDERAL GOVERNMENT.

UNDER FEDERAL LAWS CITIES CAN ISSUE THEIR OWN I.D. CARDS AND THEY DON'T HAVE TO CONSIDER IMMIGRATION STATUS OR THE CRIMINAL RECORD OF AN APPLICANT IF THEY CHOOSE NOT TO.

AS I BELIEVE COUNCILLOR ZAKIM MENTIONED OR PERHAPS COUNCILLOR WU, NEW HAVEN WAS THE FIRST TO LAUNCH A MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM. IT'S CALLED THE ELM CITY RESIDENT CARD.

THE MOST WELL KNOWN AND LARGEST MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM IS THE IDNYC PROGRAM IN NEW YORK CITY WHICH WAS LAUNCHED IN 2014.

MUNICIPAL I.D. CARDS USUALLY FEATURE A PHOTO AND SOME ON-CARD INFORMATION ABOUT THE CARD HOLDER.

THEIR ADDRESS, NAME, FOR EXAMPLE.

BUT THEY ALSO AND MORE IMPORTANTLY FACILITATE ACCESS TO BENEFITS AND CITY SERVICES.

THEY CAN ACTIVE LIBRARY CARDS.

SOME CITIES THAT HAVE MUNICIPAL I.D. CARDS WITH AN INDEBTED FUNCTIONALITY.

THERE'S A MYRIAD OF DISCOUNTS TO

MUSEUMS, CULTURAL INSTITUTIONS,
LOCAL BUSINESSES THAT ARE
IDENTIFIED WITH THE CARD.
ALL THOSE THEY'RE AVAILABLE TO
ALL RESIDENTS, THE CARDS ARE
PARTICULARLY VALUABLE AS
COUNCILLOR WU AND MENTIONED TO
UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS, PEOPLE
EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS,
YOUTH, OTHER PEOPLE THAT HAVE
NOT OBTAINED IDENTIFICATION.
THE CONCEPT OF A MUNICIPAL I.D
IN BOSTON GREW OUT OF A
COLLABORATION BETWEEN HHS AND
THE MAYOR'S OFFICE.
THIS IS BEFORE I STARTED IN MY
ROLE AT THE CITY BUT MY
UNDERSTANDING IS THAT HHS WAS
INVOLVED PRIMARILY BECAUSE THE
MAYOR'S OFFICE FOR IMMIGRANT
ADVANCEMENT SITS WITHIN THE HHS
CABINET.
AS I MENTIONED BEFORE, MUNICIPAL
I.D PROGRAMS CAN BE A TOOL FOR
EMPOWERING IMMIGRANT
COMMUNITIES, ESPECIALLY
UNDOCUMENTED RESIDENTS AND
PUBLIC SUPPORT FOR MUNICIPAL
I.D. PROGRAMS IN BOSTON AS WELL
AS OTHER CITIES HAVE BEEN
GALVANIZED PRIMARILY BY
IMMIGRANTS SERVING ADVOCACY
ORGANIZATIONS.
THE COLLABORATION BETWEEN HHS
AND THE MAYOR'S OFFICE RESULTED
IN \$100,000 OF CITY FUNDS BEING
ALLOCATED FOR YOUTH AND FAMILIES
FOR THE PURPOSE OF FURTHER
EXPLORING A MUNICIPAL I.D IN
BOSTON AS A CONCEPT.
IT WAS ALLOCATED BY THE HHS
BUDGET OF DCS BUDGET.
THAT'S WHERE THE FUNDS ENDED UP.
ORIGINALLY THE FUNDING -- AGAIN,
THERE'S A -- COULD BE USED FOR
BROAD PURPOSES.
TO EXPLORE THIS CONCEPT.
THE THINKING AT THE TIME, THIS
IS PROBABLY SUMMER OF 2016, WAS
THAT THAT \$100,000 WOULD BE USED
TO PURSUE A SMALL PILOT PROGRAM,
FOR EXAMPLE.
THAT WOULD SORT OF TEST THE
DESIGN PRINCIPLES AND THE

INFRASTRUCTURE REQUIREMENTS.
HOWEVER, IN NOVEMBER OF 2016,
DONALD TRUMP WAS ELECTED
PRESIDENT.

BECAUSE OF THE THEN
PRESIDENT-ELECT'S ANTI-IMMIGRANT
RHETORIC AND PARTICULARLY HIS
EXPRESSED INTENT TO USE THE
POWER OF THE EXECUTIVE BRANCH TO
PUNISH SANCTUARY CITIES OR
SANCTUARY POLICIES, THE
ADMINISTRATION FELT STRONGLY
THAT IF BOSTON WAS GOING TO
PURSUE A MUNICIPAL I.D, IT HAD
TO BE WITH THE SUPPORT OF THE
IMMIGRANT COMMUNITY AND ALSO HAD
TO BE A PROGRAM THAT WAS SAFE
AND SECURE FOR THE MOST
VULNERABLE USERS.

AT THE TIME WE HAVE TO STOP AND
ASK OURSELVES THIS QUESTION.
WHICH IS REALLY GIVEN THE
ANTI-IMMIGRANT POLICY PLATFORM
OF THIS FEDERAL ADMINISTRATION
AND AT THE TIME IT WAS
THEORETICAL AND NOW IT'S REAL.
DO IMMIGRANTS WANT TO A
MUNICIPAL I.D?

THAT QUESTION COMPRISES TWO
DIFFERENT DILEMMAS.
THE FIRST OF BEING A QUESTION OF
WHETHER OR NOT IMMIGRANT
COMMUNITIES FEEL A MUNICIPAL I.D
PROGRAM IN BOSTON CAN BE SAFE
AND SECURE FOR UNDOCUMENTED
RESIDENTS GIVEN THE SCRUTINY
UNDER THIS ADMINISTRATION.

BUT ALSO DOES THE COMMUNITY FEEL
THAT A MUNICIPAL I.D PROGRAM IS
THE RIGHT USE OF RESOURCES NOW.
GIVEN THAT THE STRUGGLE TO
PRESERVE AND EXPAND IN SOME
CASES THE RIGHTS OF IMMIGRANTS
IN THIS COUNTRY IS BEING FOUGHT
ON SO MANY FRONTS.

SO -- AGAIN, I'LL JUST
MENTION -- I KEEP BRINGING UP
THE IMMIGRANTS.

ALTHOUGH THE ADVOCACY IS LED BY
IMMIGRANTS SERVING
ORGANIZATIONS, I'LL JUST FOR THE
RECORD REMIND THAT MUNICIPAL I.D
PROGRAMS ARE NOT EXCLUSIVELY FOR
IMMIGRANT RESIDENTS.

I'D ARGUE THAT CHARACTERIZING THEM AS SUCH OVERLOOKS THE BROAD BENEFITS.

FIRSTLY, IMMIGRANT COMMUNITIES ARE NOT THE ONLY COMMUNITIES AS COUNCILLORS WU AND FLINT FACE UNDOCUMENTATION.

OLDER ADULTS, HOMELESSNESS, YOUTH, PEOPLE THAT DON'T OWN CARS ARE ALL MAY BE FORCED TO NAVIGATE CIVIC LIFE WITHOUT A FORMAL GOVERNMENT ISSUED FORM OF IDENTIFICATION MAKING IT DIFFICULT TO OPEN A BANK ACCOUNT, ACCESS CERTAIN PUBLIC BUILDINGS, APPLY FOR JOBS AMONG OTHER THINGS.

IDs IN SOME SENSE ARE THE GATE KEEPERS OF ACCESS TO THESE OPPORTUNITIES, WHICH WE OFTEN TAKE FOR GRANTED.

JUST A RETURN TO THAT QUESTION ABOUT GIVEN THE CONTEXT AND THE CLIMATE AROUND IMMIGRATION IN THIS COUNTRY.

WE DECIDED GIVEN THE CIRCUMSTANCES THAT THE BEST WAY TO USE THAT \$100,000 WAS TO COMMISSION WHAT WE'RE CALLING -- WHAT WE CALLED AT THE TIME AND STILL CAUSING A FEASIBILITY STUDY, WHICH IS MEANT TO BETTER UNDERSTAND THE DEMAND FOR A CARD PROGRAM IN BOSTON, ESPECIALLY AMONG KEY COMMUNITIES AND GRANTED THAT THE PROGRAM IS STILL DESIRABLE FOR RESIDENTS TO DESIGN A PROGRAM THAT IS SAFE AND SECURE AS POSSIBLE FOR ITS MOST VULNERABLE USERS AND A PROGRAM THAT CAN BE ADAPTABLE AND INCLUDES BENEFITS THAT APPEAL TO OTHER GROUPS OF RESIDENTS AND RESIDENTS BROADLY SO IT CAN BE WIDELY USED, THIS IS NECESSARY IN TERMS OF MAKING THE PROGRAM SUSTAINABLE, IF NOMINAL FEES ARE CHARGED FOR OBTAINING A CARD AND ALSO TO ENSURE THE CARD IS NOT A SCARLET LETTER.

IF ONLY UNDOCUMENTED IMMIGRANTS HAVE A MUNICIPAL I.D CARD, IT CAN BE USED FOR A COOL OF

TARGETING UNDOCUMENTED
IMMIGRANTS.

THERE'S A DELICATE BALANCE
THERE.

SO WE WROTE A PROPOSAL THAT
REFLECTED THE NEEDS OF THE CITY
WITH RESPECT TO A QUALITATIVE
DEMAND ANALYSIS AND KIND OF
ROLELY ROBUST PROGRAM DESIGN.
ON JANUARY 23, 2017, WE RELEASED
OR ISSUED THE RFP FOR THE
MUNICIPAL I.D FEASIBILITY STUDY.
WE RECEIVED DOZENS OF PROPOSALS
AND CHOSE A D.C. BASED FIRM THAT
WAS INVOLVED IN THE DESIGNING
AND IMPLEMENTATION OF THE D.C. 1
CARD.

WE CHOSE THEM AS CONSULTANTS FOR
THE PROJECT.

I SERVED AS THE PROJECT MANAGER
FOR THE WORK WITH THE TRIAGE
GROUP.

SO THE WORK, THE FEASIBILITY
STUDY THAT THEY COMPLETED, I'M
GOING TO KIND OF GIVE YOU
SOME -- I WON'T BE ABLE TO GET
INTO EVERY LAST DETAIL OF THE
REPORT NOW.

AND THE REPORTS HAVE BEEN
PROVIDED AT THE COUNSEL, I
BELIEVE.

SO YOU HAVE THE FULL -- IT'S
ABOUT 200 ODD PAGES OF TEXTS TO
READ THROUGH.

I'M GOING TO TOUCH ON SOME OF
THE MOST IMPORTANT FINDINGS IN
EACH OF THE KEY AREAS OF THE
REPORT.

SECTIONS OF THE REPORT, WHICH
WERE THE INDELIVERABLES FOR THIS
CONTRACT.

SO AS I MENTIONED BEFORE, THE
FIRST AND KIND OF THE BASE OF
THIS FEASIBILITY STUDY IS WHAT
THE WE CALLED OR WE'RE CALLING
IT THE DEMAND ANALYSIS.

WHICH PROVIDES A QUALITATIVE AND
QUANTITATIVE ASSESSMENT OF THE
DEMAND FOR THE MUNICIPAL I.D. IN
BOSTON, SOMETHING THAT WE WERE
GIVEN.

IT SEEKS TO UNDERSTAND AND
PRESENT SOME CRITICAL FINDINGS
ABOUT THE DESIRED FEATURES OF

THE CARD.

WHAT FEATURES OF THE CARD ARE MOST VALUABLE TO THE CITY OF BOSTON RESIDENTS AND ALSO WHAT SOME OF THE POTENTIAL BARRIERS TO ADOPTION ARE.

SO THE TRIAGE GROUP CONTRACTED WITH THE UMASS CENTER FOR SURVEY RESEARCH TO COMPLETE THIS DELIVERABLE, WHICH INCLUDED FOCUS GROUPS OF RESIDENTS AND AN ONLINE CITYWIDE SURVEY.

ALTHOUGH IT WAS LIMITED IN SCOPE, THE DEMAND ANALYSIS SHOWS A SUSTAINED INTEREST AMONGST -- IN THE COMMUNITY.

ALSO AMONG IMMIGRANT RESIDENTS AND AMONG LEADERS OF IMMIGRANT SERVING ORGANIZATIONS.

THE ANALYSIS IDENTIFIED KEY FEATURES THAT RESIDENTS FELT WERE VALUABLE TO THE PROGRAM ALONG WITH FEATURES THAT THEY FELT WEREN'T.

INTEGRATED CHARLIE CARD USE, WHICH CAME UP AS A VERY VALUABLE PART OF THE PROGRAM.

DISCOUNTS AT LOCAL BUSINESSES WERE ALSO FOCAL POINTS FOR PEOPLE THAT RESPONDED TO THE SURVEY AND POLLED IN FOCUS GROUPS.

THE ANALYSIS OF THE RESULTS PRODUCED A COUPLE OF KEY FINDINGS.

A CONSERVATIVE ESTIMATE USING THE UMASS MODEL PROJECTS THAT 32% OF ADULT BOSTON RESIDENTS WOULD USE A MY CARD.

MORE LIBERAL ESTIMATES PLACES THAT NUMBER AT 300,000 BOSTON RESIDENTS.

THE PRIMARY CONCERNS OF RESIDENTS CONTINUE TO BE THE VULNERABILITY OF CARD HOLDER DATA TO SPECIFICALLY IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT AND OTHER FEDERAL AGENCIES AND BROADLY A CONCERN ABOUT THE SECURITY OF DATA, PERSONAL DATA GENERALLY.

ADDITIONALLY THE MAJORITY OF RESIDENTS THAT RESPONDED TO THE SURVEY REPORTED THAT THEY WOULD

PAY \$10 FOR A CARD.
SO THOSE ARE SOME OF THE HIGHER
LEVEL RESULTS OF THE DEMAND
ANALYSIS, WHICH IS CONTAINED IN
THE ACTUAL REPORT WHICH YOU HAVE
ACCESS TO.

THE NEXT PART OF THE REPORT,
WHICH WE ARE CALLING THE PROGRAM
DESIGN, REALLY BUILDS ON THE
DEMAND ANALYSIS TO IDENTIFY THE
BASELINE DESIGN REQUIREMENTS FOR
A MUNICIPAL I.D.

THERE'S ELEMENTS OF THE PROGRAM
AND OF ANY MUNICIPAL I.D PROGRAM
THAT ARE ESSENTIAL TO ITS
FUNCTIONING.

WITHOUT A GOVERNMENT STRUCTURE,
WITHOUT ISSUANCE POLICIES AND
WITHOUT POLICIES GOVERN WHAT
CARD HOLDER APPEARS ON THE CARD
AND WHAT CARD HOLDER IS STORED
BY THE CITY, YOU WOULDN'T HAVE A
SOLID FOUNDATION TO BUILD THE
PROGRAM UNLESS YOU HAVE THE
ELEMENTS IN PLACE.

THESE ELEMENTS ARE LAID OUT IN
THE DESIGN SECTION OF THE
REPORT.

THEY'RE FLESHED OUT IN MORE
DETAIL IN THE PENULTIMATE
SECTION OF THE REPORT, WHICH IS
CALLED THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN.

WHAT I WANT TO FOCUS ON HERE IS
WHAT APPEAR IN ADDITION TO THE
BASELINE DESIGN ELEMENTS ARE A
SET OF WHAT WE MIGHT CALL
ALTERNATIVE OR OPTIONAL DESIGN
ELEMENTS WHICH ARE NOT CRITICAL
TO RUNNING A MUNICIPAL I.D
PROGRAM BUT WOULD CHANGE THE
STRUCTURE OF THE PROGRAM
DEPENDING WHETHER THEY WERE
INCLUDED OR EXCLUDED.

SO THEY INCLUDE, FOR EXAMPLE, AS
COUNCILLORS ZAKIM HAS POINTED
OUT, GEOGRAPHIC ELIGIBILITY FOR
THE CARD.

DATA CAPTURE IS ANOTHER OPTIONAL
OR ALTERNATIVE DESIGN ELEMENT.

WILL THERE BE A SYSTEM WITH
WHICH WE MIGHT CALL A RELYING
PARTY CAN CAPTURE CARD HOLDER
DATA WHEN A CARD HOLDER PRESENTS
THEIR CARD?

A RELYING PARTY IS ESSENTIALLY AN ORGANIZATION, COULD BE INTERNAL TO THE CITY OF BOSTON OR EXTERNAL THAT HAS AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY TO ACCEPT A CARD IN EXCHANGE FOR ACCESS TO A SERVICE OR BENEFIT FOR THE CARD HOLDER.

COULD BE A LIBRARY, A COMMUNITY CENTER, THE MBTA.

WHEN A CARD HOLDER PRESENTS THEIR CARD, THE RELYING PARTY CAN CONSUME THE CARD OR PROCESS THE CARD AND INFORMATION ON THE CARD IN A VARIETY OF WAYS.

ONE FORM OF PROCESSING THAT SORT OF INFORMATION, WHICH WE'RE ALL FAMILIAR WITH, IS A 2D BAR CODE ON THE CARD.

THE RELYING PARTY WOULD SCAN THE BAR CODE AND HAVE THEIR OWN DATABASE THAT WOULD BE AUTO POPULATED WITH THE INFORMATION EMBEDDED THE BAR CODE.

WHILE THIS CREATES EASE OF USE FOR THE RELYING PARTY, THE CONSENT IS NOT IMPLICIT.

IN OTHER WORDS, A RELYING PARTY COULD OBTAIN A CARD HOLDER'S INFORMATION WITHOUT THE CARD HOLDER'S FULL UNDERSTANDING OR AGREEMENT TO THE RELYING PARTY ACQUIRING THAT INFORMATION.

THAT'S ONE WAY OF DATA CAPTURING.

ANOTHER MET IS TO HAVE A BACK END DATA CAPTURE SYSTEM.

THE DATA IS STORED IN A DATABASE AND CAPTURED AT THE TIME THAT THE CARD IS ISSUED AND STORED BY THE CITY.

THE CARD HOLDER WOULD -- THE RELYING PARTY WOULD HAVE TO REQUEST ACCESS FROM THE CITY TO THAT CARD HOLDER'S INFORMATION.

THE CARD HOLDER WOULD BE NOTIFIED THAT THERE WAS A REQUEST AND WOULD NEED TO CONSENT TO THE CITY SHARING THEIR INFORMATION WITH A RELYING PARTY.

THIS GIVES MORE CONTROL TO THE CARD HOLDER AND CONTROL THEIR DATA AND CAN BE ACCOMPLISHED BY

HAVING ONLINE USER ACCOUNTS, FOR EXAMPLE.

WHEN A RELYING PARTY REQUESTS INFORMATION, A CARD HOLDER IS PINGED WITH A NOTIFICATION TO ALLOW ACCESS OR DENY ACCESS, THIS WOULD REQUIRE A MORE ROBUST INFRASTRUCTURE TO SUPPORT THOUGH.

ANOTHER OPTION IS TO HAVE NO DATA CAPTURE AT ALL, WHICH IS THE EASIEST OPTION BUT WOULD ALSO PRECLUDE ANY SORT OF EVALUATION OF THE PROGRAM. USAGE OF THE CARD WOULDN'T PRODUCE ANY DATA.

SO THESE ARE THE ALTERNATIVE DESIGN ELEMENTS THAT WE WERE FOCUSING ON IN THIS SECTION.

AGAIN, NOT ALL OF THEM NECESSARY.

THERE ARE CARD PROGRAMS THAT DO NOT HAVE DATA CAPTURE FUNCTIONS.

THERE'S MUNICIPAL I.D PROGRAMS OF ALL SIZES IN THIS COUNTRY.

BUT THAT AFFECTS WHAT THIS PROGRAM LOOKS LIKE AND HOW TO RUN IT AND ITS COST ULTIMATELY.

AFTER THIS SECTION OF THE REPORT WAS COMPLETED, REPRESENTATIVES FROM A RANGE OF CITY DEPARTMENTS MET TO REVIEW THESE DESIGN ELEMENTS AND DECIDE WHICH DESIGN ELEMENTS TO INCLUDE OF THESE ALTERNATIVES AND WHICH TO EXCLUDE.

THESE PROGRAMS ARE ADAPTABLE AND CAN CHANGE OVER TIME.

WE DETERMINED AT THE TIME OF LAUNCH, THE PROGRAM WOULD BE AVAILABLE TO CITY OF BOSTON RESIDENTS WITH THE ABILITY PERHAPS TO EXPAND TO OTHER CITIES AND TOWNS AFTER LAUNCH. AND THE PROGRAM WOULD HAVE A BACK END SYSTEM TO SUPPORT USER ACCOUNTS AND THE SHARING OF INFORMATION WITH RELYING PARTIES.

AND THIS FUNCTIONALITY WOULDN'T BE ACTIVE UPON LAUNCH.

OVER TIME RELYING PARTIES, OTHER PARTICIPANTS IN THE PROGRAM, WOULD CREATE AGREEMENTS WITH THE

CITY ABOUT DATA SHARING.

AGAIN, RELYING PARTIES BEING
COMMUNITY CENTERS, CULTURAL
INSTITUTIONS, MUSEUMS, LOCAL
BUSINESSES.

A LOT OF PARTICIPANTS IN THE
PROGRAM.

THOSE ARE THE DECISIONS THAT
WERE MADE AS A PART OF THAT PART
OF THE STUDY.

THE NEXT DELIVERABLE AND NEXT
SECTION ARE THE TECHNICAL
SECURITY AND PRIVACY STANDARDS,
WHICH PROVIDES A DESCRIPTION OF
THE ENABLING TECHNOLOGIES,
INCLUDING DIGITAL PLATFORMS AND
PROGRAMS FOR ADMINISTRATION THAT
ARE REALLY NECESSARY TO RUN A
PROGRAM, MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAMS
THAT INCLUDES THE DESIGN OPTIONS
THAT WE HIGHLIGHTED IN THE
DESIGN SECTION.

I'M NOT AN I.T. EXPERT, SO I'M
NOT GOING TO GO INTO GREAT
DETAIL ABOUT WHAT THE ENABLING
TECHNOLOGIES ARE.

BUT THE REPORT ITSELF DOES
INCLUDE A DETAILED DESCRIPTION
OF WHAT -- AT A VERY BASIC LEVEL
YOU'D NEED IN TERMS OF
INFRASTRUCTURE TO SUPPORT A
PROGRAM LIKE THIS.

THAT SECTION OF THE REPORT CAN
BE USED IN THE FUTURE AS THE
TEMPLATE OR THE POINT OF
DEPARTURE FOR AN RFP FOR A
PARTICULAR TECHNOLOGY OR AN RFQ
FOR A TEAM OF CONSULTANTS TO
BUILT THE INFRASTRUCTURE FOR A
PROGRAM.

SO THE NEXT AND PERHAPS THE MOST
IMPORTANT DELIVERABLE AND THE
ONE I'M GOING TO GO INTO MORE IN
DEPTH IS THE IMPLEMENTATION
PLAN.

WHICH PROVIDES DETAILED STEPS
AND OUTLINES THE PROCESS FOR THE
PROGRAM'S OPERATION AND SETS THE
STAGE FOR SUCCESSFUL
IMPLEMENTATION.

IT SETS THE STATION FOR A
IMPLEMENTATION OF A PROGRAM THAT
IS DESIGNED IN A PARTICULAR WAY.
OBVIOUSLY THAT DESIGN COULD BE

SUBJECT TO CHANGE.

YOU KNOW, THIS IMPLEMENTATION GIVES A GOOD FOR THIS PROGRAM. IT INCLUDES AN OVERVIEW OF THE OPERATION STRUCTURE, A PRELIMINARY BUDGET FOR THE FIRST FIVE YEARS AND IT EXPANDS ON THE BASELINE DESIGN ELEMENTS AND ALTERNATIVE DESIGN ELEMENTS IN THE PROPOSED DESIGN SECTION. I WANT TO REVIEW TWO VERY IMPORTANT ELEMENTS OF THAT SECTION.

THEY ARE ELEMENTS THAT I THINK EVERY COUNCILLOR THAT OFFERED OPENING REMARKS TOUCHED ON. THE FIRST IS THE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE PROGRAM AND THE SECOND IS THE WAY WE PROPOSED TO STORE CARD HOLDER DATA. THE FIRST, IT'S A CORE COMPONENT OF THIS PLAN FOR IMPLEMENTATION. WAS DETERMINING THE APPROPRIATE ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR THE PROGRAM.

THE PROGRAM AGAIN NEEDS TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE ACCESS TO COMMUNITIES MOST IN NEED. BUT WITHOUT JEOPARDIZING THE SECURITY OF THE PROGRAM AS A WHOLE OR MAKING IT SUSCEPTIBLE TO FRAUD, THIS REALLY BOILS DOWN TO WHAT DOCUMENTATION OR CREDENTIALS YOU REQUIRE AN APPLICANT TO PRESENT DURING THE APPLICATION PROCESS TO OBTAIN A CARD.

IT'S A DELICATE BALANCE. THE MORE DOCUMENTATION OR THE MORE EXCLUSIVE DOCUMENTATION THAT YOU'RE REQUIRED TO OBTAIN, THE HARDER IT'S TO OBTAIN. AT THE SAME TIME THE MORE CONFIDENT YOU CAN BE IN THE VALIDITY OF EACH CARD, THIS IS WHAT WE CALL A LEVEL OF ASSURANCE.

AGAIN, IT'S DETERMINED BY THE RIGOR OF THE APPLICATION PROCESS.

THE HIGHER THE BARRIER TO ENTRY, WHICH IN THIS CASE TRANSLATES TO MORE EXCLUSIVE DOCUMENTATION, THE MORE SECURE EACH IDENTITY IS

AND AT THE SAME TIME, THE HIGHER
THE THRESHOLD, THE MORE BURDEN

THERE IS.

THAT'S ONE OF THE PROBLEMS THIS
CARD SETS OUT TO SOLVE.
ONE WAY TO LOWER THAT THRESHOLD
IS TO CREATE A POINT CALCULUS.
APPLICANTS CAN ACCRUE POINTS
USING VARIOUS FORMS OF
DOCUMENTATION TOWARDS A TOTAL
SCORE THAT MAKES THEM ELIGIBLE
FOR THE CARD.

THIS IS HOW THE APPLICATION
PROCESS FOR MUNICIPAL I.Ds IN
MANY OTHER CITIES FUNCTIONS.
NEW YORK CITY HAS A VERY
ELABORATE SET OF DOCUMENTATION
THAT AN INDIVIDUAL CAN PREVENT A
CARD WITH.

DIFFERENT DOCUMENTS HAVE A
DIFFERENT POINT VALUE.
IF YOU ACCRUE ENOUGH POINTS,
YOU'RE ELIGIBLE FOR THE PROGRAM.
SOMETHING THAT IS A VERY STRONG
OF ASSERTION, WHICH IS RANKED
HIGHLY -- OUR LIST HAS THINGS
LIKE PASSPORTS OR A LETTER FROM
A SHELTER IF YOU EXPERIENCE
HOMELESSNESS AS A WAY OF
ACCRUING POINTS.

IT'S A WAY OF MAIN THANING THE
SECURITY OF THE PROGRAM BUT
EXPANDING ACCESS AT THE SAME
TIME.

SO DOCUMENTS FOR THOSE OF YOU
UNFAMILIAR FALL INTO TWO
CATEGORIES FOR THE PURPOSES OF
OBTAINING REALLY ANY FORM OF
IDENTIFICATION.

THOSE ARE PROOFS OF RESIDENCY
AND PROOFS OF IDENTITY.
THE REPORT THAT WE PROVIDED YOU
INCLUDES OUR PROPOSED LIST OF
DOCUMENTS THAT PROVE IDENTITY
AND RESIDENCY THAT WE WOULD

ACCEPT, EACH WITH ITS OWN POINT
VALUE WHICH AN APPLICATION COULD
ACCRUE TOWARDS A TOTAL SCORE
THAT WOULD MAKE THEM ELIGIBLE
FOR A CARD, THIS IS REFLECTIVE
OF A MID LEVEL OF ASSURANCE.
NOT AS DIFFICULT IT WOULD BE TO

OBTAIN A DRIVER'S LICENSE
CERTAINLY BUT NOT -- BUT
AUDITABLE IN A SENSE.
ONE OF THE THINGS THAT WE HAVE
TO THINK CAREFULLY ABOUT IS
THE -- A PROGRAM LIKE THIS,
THERE NEEDS TO BE THE ABILITY
FOR THE CITY TO VERIFY THE
VALIDITY OF A CARD, WHICH
REQUIRES SOME BARRIER TO ENTRY,
SOME ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA AND
WHAT I'M ABOUT TO SPEAK ABOUT, A
WAY OF STORING THE DATA SO THE
APPLICATION PROCESS CAN BE
AUDITED IN SOME WAY.
SO THE IMPLEMENTATION PLAN
PROPOSED SEVERAL DESIGN
SOLUTIONS FOR MINIMIZING THE
VULNERABILITY OF CARD HOLDER
DATA.
WE DO PROPOSE TO RETAIN CARD
HOLDER DATA.
WE PROPOSE THE CITY ONLY STORE
MINIMAL DATA ON EACH CARD
HOLDER, WHICH WOULD INCLUDE THE
ON-CARD INFORMATION.
ALL THE INFORMATION THAT APPEARS
ON THE PHYSICAL CARD, AS WELL AS
THE TYPE OF DOCUMENTATION USED
TO APPLY FOR THE CARD.
THERE ARE OTHER CITIES,
NEW YORK, FOR EXAMPLE, WHO
RETAIN SCANNED COPIES OF THE
DOCUMENTS THAT APPLICANTS USE TO
OBTAIN THE CARD.
SO IF YOU, FOR EXAMPLE, APPLIED
WITH YOUR PASSPORT, THE IDNYC
PROGRAM OR A PROGRAM OFFICER
WILL SCAN THE PASSPORT AND YOUR
DATA WILL INCLUDE THAT SCANNED
COPY OF THE PASSPORT, WHICH WE
CAN BE TO BE HIGH RISK.
IT'S VERY ROBUST, EASY TO DO
BACK AND CHECK TO MAKE SURE IF
THERE WERE CONCERNS ABOUT FRAUD
OR THE VALIDITY OF CARDS TO
VERIFY THAT YES, INDEED THE
PERSON THAT -- THE IDENTITY THAT
THIS CARD ASSERTS IS THE
IDENTITY OF THE PERSON THAT
APPLIES.
WE ALSO PROPOSE TO RETAIN THE
PHOTO, WHICH AGAIN IS PART OF
THE ON-CARD INFORMATION AND THE

SIGNATURE THAT THE APPLICANT PROVIDES DURING THE APPLICATION PROCESS.

SO THESE ONE SOLUTION TO DATA CAPTURE, WHICH WE FEEL CREATES A PROGRAM THAT BALANCES THE SAFETY AND SECURITY OF CARD HOLDERS AND THAT DATA AND WITH THE CITY TO MAINTAIN A PROGRAM THAT IS NOT VULNERABLE TO FRAUD.

THE SECOND PROPOSAL IS TO CONTRACT WITH A THIRD PARTY VENDOR TO MANAGE THE CARD HOLDER DATA.

WE FEEL FROM THE ASSESSMENT OF THIS FEASIBILITY STUDY THAT THERE ARE ORGANIZATIONS AND FIRMS THAT ARE BETTER EQUIPPED TO RUN AN I.D. INTEGRATED DATA MANAGEMENT SYSTEM THAN THE CITY IS.

SO THESE ARE THE TWO CORE DATA RETENTION, DATA CAPTURE PROPOSALS THAT THIS FEASIBILITY STUDY CONTAINS.

AND THE FINAL ELEMENT OF THE STUDY IS AN EVALUATION PLAN. IT PROVIDE A STUDY OF THE PROGRAM INCLUDING RECURRING AND BENCHMARK PROGRAMS.

ALL THE WAY OUT TO FIVE YEARS WE HAVE A METHOD FOR ASSESSING THE HEALTH OF THE PROGRAM.

BOTH IN TERMS OF THE FINANCIAL VIABILITY AND WHAT RESIDENTS THINK ABOUT IT.

TAKEN TOGETHER, WHAT WE'RE CALLING THE MUNICIPAL FEASIBILITY I.D. STUDY IS A DETAILED GUIDING TO BOSTON AND CAN SERVE AS AN RFT OR AN RFQ FOR A CONSULTING FIRM TO BUILD THE DATA.

FINALLY, JUST TO GIVE EVERYONE A SENSE OF THE TIMELINE OF THIS STUDY AGAIN, THE STUDY BEGAN IN THE KIND OF EARLY SPRING OR SUMMER OF 2017.

THE FEASIBILITY STUDY ITSELF WAS COMPLETED IN LATE MAY OF THIS YEAR.

THE PROJECT TOOK LONGER THAN EXPECTED AND EVEN AFTER THE FEASIBILITY STUDY WAS COMPLETE

REQUIRED A GREAT DEAL OF WORK WITH THE CONSULTANTS BECAUSE AS MANY OF YOU ARE AWARE, HHS WENT THROUGH A SUBSTANTIAL CHANGE IN LEADERSHIP IN 2017.

WE'VE BEEN WORKING SINCE THE COMPLETION OF THE FEASIBILITY STUDY WITH THE TRYIAGE GROUP TO ENSURE THAT WHAT WAS PROVIDED IN THE REPORT MEETS THE EXECUTIVE NEEDS AND EXPECTATIONS OF THE NEW LEADERSHIP OF HHS.

WE'RE STILL WORKING THROUGH THE IMPLICATIONS OF THE REPORT FOR IMPLEMENTATION AND WE'RE ESPECIALLY SENSITIVE TO THE ONGOING STRUGGLE CURRENTLY BECAUSE OF THE CLIMATE SURROUNDING IMMIGRATION IN THIS COUNTRY.

THIS SUMMER ESPECIALLY HAS BEEN -- WE'VE SEEN A LOT OF THE THEORETICAL THREATS THAT WE WERE ALL WORRIED ABOUT CERTAINLY IN EARLY 2017.

WE'VE SEEN MANY OF THEM BECOME REALITIES NOW.

AGAIN, THIS HAS REALLY SERIOUS IMPLICATIONS FOR IMPLEMENTING A MUNICIPAL I.D PROGRAM IN BOSTON AND ELSEWHERE.

THE COUNCIL, I BELIEVE, INTERGOVERNMENTAL RELATIONS PROVIDED TO THE COUNSEL A COPY OF THE REPORT.

IT WILL BECOME PUBLIC SHORTLY. AGAIN, WE'RE WORKING WITH CHIEF MARTINEZ TO ENSURE THAT THIS REPORT DESPITE ITS BEING INITIATED UNDER DIFFERENT LEADERSHIP REFLECTS THE NEEDS AND VALUES OF THIS CURRENT HHS LEADERSHIP TEAM.

SO THAT'S NOT SO MUCH BRIEF, BUT AN OVERVIEW OF THE FEASIBILITY STUDY.

I'M HAPPY TO ANSWER ANY QUESTIONS THAT ANY COUNCILLORS HAVE ABOUT THAT.

AND IF I'M UNABLE TO ANSWER QUESTIONS, I'M HAPPY TO FOLLOW UP.

>> THANK YOU, MR. LIMA, FOR YOUR THOROUGH PRECIPITATION.

IT'S GREATLY APPRECIATED.
FOR THE RECORD, WE ARE ALSO
JOINED BY CITY COUNCIL PRESIDENT
ANDREA CAMPBELL AND JOINED BY
COUNCILLOR FLAHERTY.
COUNCILLOR CAMPBELL, WOULD YOU
LIKE TO GIVE AN OPENING
STATEMENT?

I'D ALSO LIKE TO MAKE -- READ
INTO THE RECORD SOME CITY
COUNCIL AYANNA PRESLEY.
DEAR MR. CHAIRMAN, I REGRET DUE
TO MY PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED NEW
MEMBER OF CONGRESS ORIENTATION
IN WASHINGTON D.C., I WILL NOT
BE ABLE TO ATTEND TODAY'S
COMMITTEE ON CITY NEIGHBORHOOD
SERVICES HEARING REGARDING
IMPLEMENTATION OF A ONE-CARD
PROGRAM IN THE CITY OF BOSTON.
I WOULD LIKE TO THANK THE CHAIR
FOR HOSTING THIS HEARING AND THE
AUTHOR OF THIS ORDER FOR
ELEVATING THIS CRITICAL
CONVERSATION.

I WAS PROUD TO CHAIR A HEARING
ON THIS MATTER IN OCTOBER OF
2016.

AS I STATED THEN, THIS IDEA IS
AN EXAMPLE OF MUNICIPAL
GOVERNMENTS BEING RESPONSIVE.
EVERY BOSTONIAN DESERVES TO FEEL
SAFE IN THEIR COMMUNITY AND LACK
OF FORMAL I.D. SHOULD NOT BE A
BARRIER FOR ANYONE.

I LOOK FORWARD TO REVIEWING THE
RECORD, THE RECORDING AND WILL
HAVE STAFF PRESENT.

THANK YOU.

AYANNA PRESLEY, BOSTON CITY
COUNCIL.

I'D LIKE TO READ ANOTHER LETTER
FROM KIM JANEY.

DEAR MR. CHAIR, I REGRET I'M
UNABLE TO ATTEND THE HEARING ON
THE COMMITTEE OF CITY AND
NEIGHBORHOOD SERVICES REGARDING
THE IMPLEMENTATION OF A ONE CARD
MUNICIPAL IDENTIFICATION PROGRAM
IN THE CITY OF BOSTON.

CREATING A MUNICIPAL I.D.
PROGRAM THAT IS OPEN TO ALL
RESIDENTS I HAVE ONE OR TWO
QUESTIONS, I GUESS.

IF THIS CARD IS INTEGRATED, HOW CAN WE IMPOSE SAFEGUARDS TO ENSURE PERSONAL INFORMATION IS NOT BEING SHARED ACROSS NETWORKS AND CAN YOU DESCRIBE THE PROCESS FOR ADDRESSING PUBLIC SAFETY AND BANKING INSTITUTIONS?

HOW CAN WE ASSURE THE PROBLEM IS SUCCESSFUL WITHOUT AVOIDING ABUSE?

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILLOR FLYNN.

SO THE ANSWER YOUR FIRST QUESTION, THE -- THOSE DESIGN ELEMENTS THAT I MENTION IN THE PENULTIMATE SECTION OF MY PRESENTATION THAT HAVE TO DO WITH WHAT INFORMATION IS STORED AND WHERE IT'S STORED ARE REALLY THE ESSENTIAL COMPONENTS TO BUILDING A SECURE PROGRAM.

AGAIN, WHAT IS POTENTIALLY -- THERE'S A RISK ASSOCIATED WITH THE AMOUNT OF DATA THAT YOU STORE ON A POTENTIAL CARD HOLDER.

DIFFERENT CITIES CHOOSE TO DO THAT DIFFERENTLY.

WE FELT THE AMOUNT OF INFORMATION THAT IS RETAINED FROM THE APPLICATION PROCESS CREATES A -- IS MORE SECURE BECAUSE THAT INFORMATION IS NOT VALUABLE IN THE HANDS OF SOMEONE WHO MIGHT WISH HARM ON A CARD HOLDER.

I'M NOT A LEGAL EXPERT, SO I CAN'T SPEAK TO THE RISK OF STORED DATA, WHETHER IT'S HELD BY THE CITY OR BY A THIRD PARTY VENDOR.

I CAN'T SPEAK TO THE RISK OF THIS BEING OBTAINED BY A FEDERAL AGENCY, FOR EXAMPLE.

BUT I CAN SAY THAT IN THE FEASIBILITY STUDY AND THINKING ABOUT HOW TO DESIGN THIS PROGRAM, ONE OF THE THINGS WE WERE CONSIDERING IS WHAT IS THE INFORMATION THAT WE'RE RETAINING AND WHAT IS THE -- AND HOW CAN WE -- HOW CAN WE DESIGN THAT RETENTION SO IT'S NOT HIGH RISK.

I BELIEVE YOUR SECOND QUESTION HAS TO DO WITH BANKING

INSTITUTIONS.

THE ANSWER THERE IS REALLY IF A PROGRAM WERE TO BE LAUNCHED AND THESE AGREEMENTS COULD BE CREATED BEFORE LAUNCH, BUT THE CITY WOULD WORK WITH FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS, WHETHER THAT IS -- I DON'T THINK THERE'S MUNICIPAL I.D PROGRAMS IN THIS COUNTRY THAT WORK WITH NATIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS.

BUT CERTAINLY STATE AND LOCAL, REGIONAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS. IT WOULD REQUIRE THE CITY COMING TO AN AGREEMENT WITH EACH INDIVIDUAL FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS, WHICH WOULD COMPRISE THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTIONS AGREEING TO ACCEPTED THAT CARD, THE MUNICIPAL I.D. CARD, FOR SOME PURPOSE, PERHAPS TO OPEN A BANK ACCOUNT.

IT WOULD REQUIRE THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTION FEELING THE CARD WAS SECURITY ENOUGH THAT THE ASSERTION OF IDENTITY OF EACH CARD WAS VALID BASED ON THE FINANCIAL INSTITUTION'S REVIEW OF THE ISSUANCE POLICIES, THE REVIEW OF THE SAFETY AND SECURITY PROTOCOLS OF THE CITY. IT WOULD BE ABOUT THE AGREEMENT OF EACH FINANCIAL INSTITUTION AND THE CITY ITSELF.

AGAIN, THAT'S TRUE OF ALL RELYING PARTIES.

YOU KNOW, A BCYF COMMUNITY CENTER OR MUSEUM, THOSE RELYING PARTIES WOULD ENTER INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY WITH A FULL UNDERSTANDING OF HOW THE PROGRAM WORKS, OF THE SECURITY OF THE PROGRAM AND ESSENTIALLY A RELYING PARTY BECOMES A RELYING PARTY WHEN THEY ACCEPT THAT THE ASSERTION OF THE IDENTITYq BASED ON THEIR ASSESSMENT OF THE CITY'S POLICIES AND SECURITYV SAFEGUARDS.

>> THANK YOU, SIR.

AND AT THIS TIME, I WOULDçóñr LIKE TO ASKñi COUNCILOR IF SHEi] HAS ANY QUESTIONS.

>> THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.
THANK YOU SOCHAIRMAN.
THANK YOU SO MUCH.
REALLY HELPFUL.
TRYING TO FOLLOW ALONG AS YOU
WERE SAYING THIS.
ALSO FOR THE RECORD, I KNOW YOU
SAID IT'S GOING TO BE PUBLIC
SHORTLY BUT I TWEETED IT.
PEOPLE ARE ABLE TO READ.
THIS READS TO ME AS A DIRECT
ROAD MAP FOR POSSIBLY THE MOST
COMPREHENSIVE PROGRAM THAT THE
CITY WOULD HAVE ACROSS THE
COUNTRY.

I THINK THIS IS AN EXCELLENT
STUDY THAT CONSIDERS ALL THE
PIECES OF HOW TO MAKE IT HAVE
WIDE APPEAL

>> ONE AND A HALF MILLION
DOLLARS ANNUALLY?

>> RIGHT AND THIS IS A PROGRAM
THAT HAS PARTICULAR DESIGN
ELEMENTS, RIGHT?

YOU COULD SCALE BACK OR SCALE UP
CERTAIN COMPONENTS OF IT.

YOU COULD, YOU KNOW -- YOU COULD
CREATE MORE ENROLLMENT CENTERS
OR FEWER ENROLLMENT CENTERS.

THERE'S A FAIR AMOUNT OF
ADAPTABILITY AND FLEXIBILITY IN
TERMS OF THE CONTENT AND
STRUCTURE OF THE PROGRAM, BUT
THAT WAS A SORT OF PRELIMINARY
BUDGET BASED ON INCORPORATING
THOSE ESSENTIAL DESIGN ELEMENTS
THAT WE TALKED ABOUT AT THE
BEGINNING BUT ALSO SOME OF THOSE
OPTIONAL DESIGN ALTERNATIVES,
AND THEN, OF COURSE, THE VERY --
THE KIND OF -- THE DIVERSE
INFRASTRUCTURE THAT'S REQUIRED
TO SUPPORT A PROGRAM, THAT
INCLUDES TECHNOLOGY AS WELL AS
PERSONNEL AND THE ADMINISTRATION
OF THE PROGRAM.

THE GOVERNANCE BODY WITHIN THE
CITY THAT WOULD TASKED WITH
ADMINISTERING THE PROGRAM SO
IT'S PRELIMINARY AND FLEXIBLE,
BUT YEAH, WE ATTEMPTED TO
PROVIDE A PROJECTED BUDGET FOR
THE FIRST FIVE YEARS AFTER
IMPLEMENTATION.

>> SO BASICALLY, IF THE CITY OF BOSTON WANTED TO LAUNCH THIS AT \$8 MILLION OVER THE NEXT FIVE YEARS, THIS WOULD BE A PROGRAM THAT YOU FEEL THAT THE OFFICE FEELS IS SECURE ENOUGH AND HITS EVERY OTHER METRIC OF WHAT THE RESIDENTS WOULD WANT TO SEE?

>> YES TO A POINT.

WHAT RESIDENTS WANT MAY EVOLVE AND SO THERE'S -- THERE'S THE DESIRE AND WHAT'S VALUABLE TO RESIDENTS IS EMERGENT.

IT ALSO DEPENDS AGAIN ON -- ON RESIDENTS' RISK ASSESSMENT AND WE DID THE DEMAND ANALYSIS IN 2017 AND IF WE WERE TO DO IT AGAIN, PERHAPS WE WOULD FIND DIFFERENT RESULTS NOW GIVEN THE FACT THAT JUST THIS SUMMER, WE HAD -- OR WE CURRENTLY HAVE THE DEPARTMENT OF HOMELAND SECURITY ATTEMPTING TO CHANGE THE RULES OF PUBLIC CHARGE, WHICH IS AGAIN ONE OF THOSE SORT OF THEORETICAL THREATS TO COMMUNITIES BECOMING A VERY, VERY STARK REALITY. AND SO THE -- WHAT'S VALUABLE TO RESIDENTS AND WHAT IS -- AND WHAT -- WHAT IS A RISK FOR RESIDENTS IS SUBJECT TO CHANGE.

>> AND SO WHAT WE'VE -- WHAT WE'VE DONE IS REALLY PROVIDE -- WHAT WE THINK IS THE IDEAL PROGRAM WITH THE ABILITY TO BUILD IT OUT TO INCORPORATE OTHER VALUABLE ELEMENTS DOWN THE ROAD, BUT AT A MOMENT IN TIME.

>> GREAT AND I THOUGHT IT WAS REALLY INTERESTING THIS TABLE ON PAGE 13 ABOUT THE PERCENTAGE OF RESIDENTS WHO ARE LIKELY TO USE THE CARDS, THAT EVERY DEMOGRAPHIC SURVEYED WAS MORE LIKELY THAN NOT TO USE THE CARD, EXCEPT FOR THOSE WHO DON'T HAVE A CHARLIE CARD AND THOSE WHO ARE AGES 55 TO 64.

BUT THE SENIORS 65 AND OVER ARE ONCE AGAIN MORE LIKELY TO USE IT THAN NOT.

BUT ACROSS EVERY OTHER DEMOGRAPHIC OF AGE, OF ETHNICITY, OF EDUCATION LEVEL,

THOSE WHO WORK IN BOSTON, AND INTERESTINGLY THOSE WHO WERE BORN IN THE UNITED STATES WITH 56% LIKELY TO USE A MUNICIPAL I.D. CARD AND THOSE WHO ARE NOT BORN IN THE UNITED STATES SO EITHER IMMIGRANT RESIDENTS OR KIND OF FIRST, SECOND GENERATION, ALMOST 73% EVEN MORE LIKELY TO USE THE CARD, PERHAPS REFLECTING SOME OF THE GAPS AND BARRIERS TO FORMAL I.D. SO IT SEEMS TO ME AT THIS POINT IT'S A POLICY QUESTION ABOUT DOES THE CITY WANT TO DO THIS AND AGAIN, WHERE DOES THIS FALL IN THE LIST OF PRIORITIES OF HOW TO BE MOST EFFECTIVE SUPPORTING THE COMMUNITIES THAT WOULD BE AFFECTED OR SUPPORTED BY THIS PROGRAM AND I FEEL VERY COMFORTABLE AND AM GRATEFUL TO THE ADMINISTRATION FOR HAVING DONE THE WORK TO THIS POINT TO SAY HOW WE HAVE THE PLAN, WE HAVE THE COSTS FIGURED, IT'S JUST ABOUT WHERE IT FALLS AND IN THE CITY'S RESOURCES BOTH FROM A STAFFING PERSPECTIVE, STAFFING PERSPECTIVE AND FUNDING OF WHETHER WE WANT TO HIT THE GO BUTTON AND MOVE FORWARD. BUT THANK YOU FOR YOUR PRESENTATION.

>> YOU'RE WELCOME.

THANK YOU, COUNCILOR WU.
AT THIS TIME, COUNCILOR ZAKIM DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS?

>> THANK YOU FOR THE PRESENTATION.

I CERTAINLY AGREE WITH THE COUNCILOR'S COMMENTS, THIS SEEMS LIKE IT'S A YES OR NO DECISION FOR THE CITY OF BOSTON, BUT I DO HAVE A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS. I THINK I HEARD YOU MENTION THAT THERE WERE 300,000 POTENTIAL USERS OF THE CARD IN THE CITY OF BOSTON?

>> YEAH, THAT'S A MORE LIBERAL ESTIMATE.

THE MORE CONSERVATIVE ESTIMATE IS ABOUT 32% OF BOSTON RESIDENTS WOULD BE NOT JUST -- WOULD NOT

JUST APPLY FOR A CARD BUT APPLY AND USE A CARD.

>> AND IS THAT TAKING INTO ACCOUNT -- IS THAT SAYING LIKE THE DISCOUNT CARD, YOUR LIBRARY CARD OR PRIMARY I.D.?

>> SO IN THE DEMAND ANALYSIS, RESPONDENTS TO THE SURVEY WERE PRESENTED WITH ESSENTIALLY WHAT A MUNICIPAL I.D. COULD BE.

AND THAT'S A REALLY GREAT QUESTION BECAUSE WHAT WE DIDN'T DO IN THE DEMAND ANALYSIS WAS JUST PRESENT SORT OF LIKE YOUR STANDARD I.D. CARD AS THE -- AS THE PRODUCT.

WE PRESENTED A MUNICIPAL I.D. CARD WHICH COULD POTENTIALLY INCLUDE THIS LIST OF BENEFITS, ACCESS TO MUSEUMS AND CULTURAL INSTITUTIONS, A POTENTIAL INTEGRATION WITH THE CHARLIE CARD, AND ACTUALLY ONE INTERESTING THING ABOUT THE SURVEY THAT WE RAN IS IT USED A VERY INTERESTING METHODOLOGY WHETHERBY SURVEY RESPONDENTS COULD ACTUALLY SUBMIT THEIR OWN IDEAS ABOUT VALUABLE FUNCTIONS FOR THE CARD AND THAT IDEA THAT THEY SUBMITTED WOULD ACTUALLY BE PRESENTED TO DOWNSTREAM SURVEY RESPONDENTS AS ONE OF THE MANY FEATURES OF THE CARD THAT COULD POTENTIALLY BE INCORPORATED AND THEN THEY WOULD BE ASKED TO RANK WHICH ONES THEY FELT WERE MOST IMPORTANT OR MOST VALUABLE.

AND SO AGAIN, THAT -- THAT INTEREST, THE INTEREST THAT WE'RE TRYING TO SORT OF QUANTIFY IN THE DEMAND, UNLESS IS REALLY INTEREST IN A CARD WITH MANY OR ALL OF THESE VERY VALUABLE OR THE MOST VALUABLE ELEMENTS TO RESIDENTS INCLUDED.

SO I DON'T THINK -- WHAT WE'RE ASSERTING IS NOT THAT ANY MUNICIPAL I.D. CARD THAT THE CITY OF BOSTON WERE TO ISSUE WOULD GARNER 32% ADOPTION RATE. RATHER, A MUNICIPAL I.D. WITH CERTAIN IMPORTANT BENEFITS ATTACHED TO IT WOULD GARNER THAT

SUPPORT.

>> AND WHAT ABOUT USING IT AS AN I.D.?

PEOPLE GOING TO GET A DRINK OR AT A BANK, WHAT ARE THE RULES? CLEARLY, IT'S A GOVERNMENT-ISSUED I.D., BUT I DON'T WANT TO GET INTO THE REAL I.D. ISSUES ABOUT GETTING ON A PLANE BECAUSE THAT'S NOT FEASIBLE FOR THIS, BUT IF YOU'RE GOING TO A BAR OR A MARIJUANA DISPENSARY OR ANY OF THESE PLACES, WOULD THIS OR EVEN A BANK OR CHECK CASHED, WOULD THESE PLACES ACCEPT THIS? DO OTHER CITIES -- WHAT HAPPENED?

>> MUNICIPAL I.D. CARDS ACROSS THE COUNTRY CANNOT BE USED TO, FOR EXAMPLE, BUY ALCOHOL OR TOBACCO, TO GET ON A PLANE, FOR EXAMPLE.

THERE ARE -- THERE ARE LIMITATIONS THAT ALL CITIES -- MY UNDERSTANDING IS THAT ALL CITIES PLACE ON THESE CARDS. AND PRIMARILY BECAUSE THERE ARE SAFETY CONCERNS, BUT ALSO BECAUSE THE PURPOSE OF THESE CARDS IS REALLY TO INCREASE ACCESS TO LOCAL SERVICES AND OPPORTUNITIES.

AND SO -- AND THAT ACCESS IS ALWAYS MEDIATED BY AN AGREEMENT WITH THE ENTITY THAT IS SUPPLYING THAT BENEFIT.

AND SO FOR AN INDIVIDUAL TO USE THEIR CARD IN A GIVEN LOCATION REQUIRES THAT THAT BUSINESS ORGANIZATION, AGENCY, HAVE AN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY.

AND SO WHAT THE CARD CAN OR CANNOT BE USED FOR IS GOVERNED BY THOSE AGREEMENTS.

IF A CARD IN ANOTHER CITY, FOR EXAMPLE, WERE -- IF SOMEONE AT A LIQUOR STORE, FOR EXAMPLE, WERE TO ACCEPT THE CARD, THAT WOULD BE A VIOLATION OF THEIR OWN -- OF THEIR OWN REGULATIONS BECAUSE A MUNICIPAL I.D., IN THE ENABLING LEGISLATION AND POLICIES THAT GOVERN THESE

PROGRAMS, SET FORTH LIMITATIONS ON WHAT IT CAN BE USED FOR AND SO AGAIN THAT REALLY HAS TO DO MORE WITH POLICY.

>> I.D. IS A BIT OF A MISNOMER?

WELL, FOR EXAMPLE, IF A RELYING PARTY, SOMEONE IN AGREEMENT WITH THE CITY TO ACCEPT THE CARD WERE THE BOSTON POLICE DEPARTMENT, A MUNICIPAL I.D. COULD BE USED AND SERVE AS A FORM OF IDENTIFICATION WHEN, FOR EXAMPLE, IF YOU -- IF THERE'S BEEN A BREAK-IN AND YOU CALL THE POLICE ONE OF THE FIRST THINGS AN OFFICER WILL ASK FOR IS FOR A FORM OF IDENTIFICATION. AND SO IF THE BOSTON POLICE DEPARTMENT AND THE CITY OF BOSTON WERE TO COME TO AN AGREEMENT ABOUT THE SECURITY OF THE CARD AND THAT BOSTON POLICE OFFICERS WOULD ACCEPT THE CARD, AGAIN CONDITIONAL ON THAT AGREEMENT, THEN THAT MUNICIPAL I.D. COULD SERVE AS AN I.D. THAT AN INDIVIDUAL COULD PRESENT TO A POLICE OFFICER IN THE EVENT THAT THEY WERE REPORTING A CRIME OR IN SOME OTHER SITUATION.

>> OKAY.

SO IT DOES HAVE -- IT DOES HAVE I.D. FUNCTIONS.

>> BUT I GUESS I MEAN -- AND I APPRECIATE, AND I THINK IT'S GREAT THAT WE HAVE, YOU KNOW, A CHARLIE CARD ON THERE, ALL THE THINGS THAT MAKE IT MORE APPEALING TO FOLKS WHO HAVE OTHER OPTIONS FOR I.D.

BUT TO ADDRESS SOME OF THE REAL CONCERNS WE'RE TALKING ABOUT, WHETHER IT'S AN UNDOCUMENTED POPULATION, HOMELESS POPULATION, FOLKS FOR WHATEVER REASON AREN'T ABLE TO GET A STATE ISSUED OR FEDERAL ISSUED I.D.

THAT DOES SEEM TO BE ONE OF THE CENTRAL THINGS WE WANT TO TACKLE HERE AND IS THAT -- AND I'LL STOP BECAUSE THERE ARE OTHER QUESTIONS.

IS THAT A POLICY DECISION THE CITY HAS TO MAKE OR IS THAT A

STATE LAW MANDATE?

DO WE HAVE THE FLEXIBILITY ON
THAT MOVING FORWARD?

>> SO IT'S PARTIALLY A POLICY
DECISION AND THAT HAS TO DO WITH
WHAT THE CITY FEELS
COMFORTABLE -- HOW THE CITY
FEELS COMFORTABLE WITH RESIDENTS
USING THIS CARD.

IT ALSO HAS TO DO WITH THE
STRENGTH OF OUR PARTNERSHIPS.
AND THIS IS ACTUALLY PART OF THE
REPORT.

THERE'S A PHASE OF
IMPLEMENTATION, WHICH IS ALMOST
PRE-IMPLEMENTATION, WHICH HAS TO
DO WITH GATHERING POTENTIAL
AGENCIES AND RELYING PARTIES
THAT COULD ACCEPT THE CARD TO
BUILD A ROBUST NETWORK OF -- OF
CARD CONSUMERS ESSENTIALLY,
BECAUSE THAT'S HOW YOU REALLY
OPEN ACCESS FOR VULNERABLE
RESIDENTS TO THESE ESSENTIAL
SERVICES, THE FOCAL POINT OF
MUNICIPAL I.D. CARDS SINCE THEIR
INCEPTION BUT AT THE SAME TIME,
IT CREATES AN ARRAY OF BENEFITS
SO THAT -- SO THAT RESIDENTS WHO
ALREADY HAVE DRIVER'S LICENSES,
FOR EXAMPLE, WOULD BE INTERESTED
IN GETTING A CARD, WHICH HELPS
YOU AVOID WHAT WE'RE CALLING
THIS KIND OF SCARLET LETTER
EFFECT.

>> AND I AGREE, AND I THINK
THAT'S A GREAT IDEA AND I
CERTAINLY THINK WOULD BE HAPPY
TO SEE THIS IN THE FORM YOU
PROPOSED, BUT I WOULD ALSO URGE
YOU AND THE ADMINISTRATION,
PERHAPS THE CORPORATION COUNCIL
TO LOOK AND SEE WHAT IS POSSIBLE
BEYOND THAT BECAUSE I THINK
WHILE IT'S GREAT FOR CIVIC
PRIDE, FOR PEOPLE HAVING SOME
FORM OF I.D. FOR CERTAIN
PURPOSES I THINK THE BIG ISSUE
HERE IS MAKING SURE THESE
POPULATIONS THAT DON'T HAVE THE
ABILITY FOR WHATEVER REASON TO
GET A STATE I.D. OR A FEDERAL
I.D. WHO ARE LIVING HERE IN THE
CITY OF BOSTON, WE NEED TO DO

THE MOST WE CAN CONSISTENT WITH
THE LAW, CONSISTENT WITH OUR OWN
SECURITY NEEDS, TO DO THAT.
SO AGAIN, I DON'T KNOW OFFHAND
WHAT'S PERMISSIBLE.
I DON'T SEE THAT THE CITY OF
BOSTON, YOU KNOW, WOULD HAVE ANY
LIABILITY IF SOMEONE USED THIS
TO PURCHASE ALCOHOL OR TO
PURCHASE SOMETHING ELSE SO I
WOULD LIKE TO EXPLORE THAT,
SOMEWHAT EXPANSIVE AND I'LL
LEAVE IT AT THAT BECAUSE I HAVE
ANOTHER ENGAGEMENT, BUT I WANT
TO THANK YOU FOR YOUR WORK ON
THIS.

I THANK THE SPONSOR AND THE
CHAIR FOR HOLDING THIS HEARING.
IT'S IMPORTANT TO SEE
SIGNIFICANT PROGRESS ON THIS SO
THANK YOU.

>> YOU'RE WELCOME.

[OFF MIC] WHEN WE HAD FIRST
STARTED DISCUSSING THIS IN
2015-16, IT WAS ALSO
CONTEMPLATED THAT THERE WOULD
NEED TO BE A COMPLEMENTARY
MUNICIPAL I.D. ORDINANCE THAT
WOULD SPECIFY THE SCOPE OF WHICH
AGENCIES TO LOOP IN AND THE SORT
OF MAXIMUM THAT THE CITY COULD
PUSH THROUGH SO I THINK THAT
WOULD VERY MUCH BE PART OF IT.

>> AND OTHER MUNICIPALITIES, NEW
YORK, FOR EXAMPLE, HAVE CITY
ORDINANCES THAT ARE BASICALLY
THE ENABLING LEGISLATION FOR
THESE PROGRAMS, WHICH INCLUDE
THOSE SECURITY POLICIES WHERE
THE CARD CAN BE USED AND SO ON
AND SO FORTH.

>> THANK YOU.

, COUNCILOR.

I WOULD LIKE TO ASK CITY COUNCIL
PRESIDENT ANDREA CAMPBELL IF SHE
HAS ANY QUESTIONS.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILOR FLYNN
AND THANK YOU TO COUNCILOR WU
THE SPONSOR ON THIS AND THANK
YOU FOR THIS ROBUST
PRESENTATION.

LOOK FORWARD TO REVIEWING THE
REPORT.

I'M JUST CURIOUS.

THE REASON WE WERE HOLDING UP
RELEASING IT PUBLICLY?

>> WELL, AGAIN SO BECAUSE OF THE
CHANGE IN LEADERSHIP IN HHS, THE
SCOPE OF THE REPORT, ITS
CONTENT, THE CONTRACT ITSELF WAS
INITIATED WITH THE CONSULTING
TEAM THAT WE WERE WORKING WITH
IN 2017 AND SO WE WANTED TO MAKE
SURE THAT THE CONTENTS OF THE
REPORT REFLECTED CHIEF MARTY
MARTINEZ'S EXPECTATIONS OF IT
AND WE'VE BEEN WORKING TO TWEAK
ELEMENTS OF THE REPORT
AND INCLUDE IN SOME CASES
NON-CITIZEN, YOU DON'T HAVE THE
ABILITY TO VOTE AND IF YOU ARE
ACCUSED OF VOTING THAT
POTENTIALLY IMPACTS YOUR ABILITY
TO SECURE RESIDENCY.

I JUST WANT TO BE SENSITIVE TO
THAT, BUT FROM A PERSPECTIVE OF
TRYING TO HELP MOVE THE LINES,
PARTICULARLY THAT LAST ELECTION,
THE LINES WERE SO LONG AND YOU
MIGHT HAVE SOMEBODY FROM THE SAME
PRECINCT AND NEIGHBORHOOD,
BUT THEY JUST MOVED AROUND THE
CORNER, THAT WAS VERY TIME
CONSUMING FOR FOLK AND THAT
CREATED BACKUP AND LONG LINES
AND WE WANT TO TRY TO MAKE
THINGS EASIER AND MORE EFFICIENT
FOR FOLKS TO BE ABLE TO CAST
THEIR VOTES.

I DIDN'T KNOW WHETHER OR NOT
ANYBODY ON THE SURVEY HAD
RESPONDED.
THAT WOULD BE A GREAT WAY TO BE
ABLE TO HAVE THAT I.D. THAT
IMMEDIATELY SIGNALS THAT YOU'RE
ACTUALLY LIVING AT THAT ADDRESS
WHAT SOME OTHER MAJOR CITIES
HAVE THEIR
THEIR CARD

THAT SURVEY, DOES IT DOVE TAIL
WITH WHAT NEW YORK AND SAN
FRANCISCO ARE DOING WITH THEIR
MUNICIPAL I.D.'S?

>> I WOULD SAY THE REAL DRIVER
OF THE CARDS SEEMS TO BE THE
CULTURAL BENEFITS THAT THEY
ACCRUE SO THOSE SORTS OF
DISCOUNTS AND ACCESS.
THERE'S ACTUALLY AN

EVALUATION -- THEY DID FOCUS ON
GROUPS AND
SURVEY AS WELL TRYING TO
UNDERSTAND FOR
APPLY FOR AND ARE USING THE CARD
WHY ARE THEY DOING IT?
INTERESTINGLY ENOUGH, ONE OF THE
BIG DRIVERS OF ADOPTION WAS
SIGNS & VISITANTS WANTING TO SHOW
THEIR SUPPORT FOR THE
PROGRAM.
BUT AGAIN, THE REAL -- THE REAL
MEAT OF THE -- WHAT WAS DRIVING
ADOPTION HAD A
TO A CERTAIN
UNDERSTANDING THAT APPLYING FOR
AND USING
VULNERABLE COMMUNITIES THAT
DON'T TRADITIONALLY HAVE VERY
GOOD ACCESS TO
FORMS OF IDENTIFICATION, BUT
ALSO BECAUSE IT PROVIDED THIS
LIST OF BENEFITS.
I MEAN, I CAN'T REMEMBER EXACTLY
WHAT THEY WERE, BUT
THE
REDUCED PRICE MEMBERSHIPS TO THE
MUSEUMS, TO MOMA, IT WAS LIKE A
NETWORK OF BENEFITS THAT WERE
ATTACHED TO IT AND MY
UNDERSTANDING IT WAS THE
CULTURAL BENEFITS THAT WERE
DRIVING.
I APPRECIATE YOUR TIME AND
ATTENTION TO THAT AND
YOUR SURVEYS IF THERE'S ANY
FOLLOW-UP SURVEYS IF YOU COULD
DIAL IN AROUND WHAT PEOPLE'S
THOUGHTS ARE IN TERMS OF THE
ELECTIONS AND PARTICULARLY AS IT
PERTAINS TO CHANGE OF ADDRESS OR
CHANGE OF PARTY AFFILIATION AND
THAT SEEMS TO CAUSE A LITTLE BIT
OF A CONUNDRUM AS YOU'RE
APPROACHING THE -- THE BALLOT
BOX AND JUST CAUSES MINUTES,
STEP ASIDE AND THEY HAVE TO CALL
DOWN TO THE ELECTION DEPARTMENT
AND THEY HAVE TO CONFIRM YOUR
ADDRESS AND IF EVERYTHING WAS ON
THE CARD AND THE WARDEN AT THE
PRECINCT WOULD BE ABLE TO SWIPE
IT AND CONFIRM THAT YES, ED
FLYNN LIVES DOWN ON GOLD STREET

OR MY FATHER
ROAD.

AND THEN HERE'S YOUR BALLOT, YOU
CAN VOTE.

I KNOW THAT WHAT HAPPENED WITH THE
LONG LINES AT THE ELECTIONS AND
THE LAST COUPLE OF ELECTIONS
IT'S BEEN AN ISSUE THAT'S
BROUGHT TO MY ATTENTION.
YOU HAVE LIFE-LONG RESIDENTS,
BUT THEY'VE MOVED ACROSS THE
STREET OR THEY'VE CHANGED PARTY
AFFILIATION AND THAT'S CAUSED A
BACKUP AT THAT LOCATION, BUT
HAVING THIS CARD THAT CAN BE
SWIPED, IT CAN CONFIRM THE
PARTY AFFILIATION AND/OR THEIR
ADDRESS, I THINK WOULD HELP
ALLEVIATE SOME OF THOSE ISSUES
NOT ONLY AT THE POLLING
LOCATION, BUT AT THE ELECTION
DEPARTMENT.

JUST TRYING TO
READILY ACCESSIBLE AND EASY AND
MORE EFFICIENT FOR FOLKS TO COME
OUT AND PARTICIPATE SO YOU
APPRECIATE YOUR TIME AND
ATTENTION TO THAT.

THANK YOU, MR. CHAIRMAN.

>> THANK YOU, COUNCILOR.

AT THIS TIME, I WOULD LIKE TO
ASK IF ANYONE IN THE AUDIENCE
PLANS TO TESTIFY?

OR OFFER COMMENTS?

OKAY!

SO I DON'T THINK WE NEED TO DO
ANOTHER ROUND OF QUESTIONING.
POINT

PRIOR TO THIS JOB, I WORKED AS A
PROBATION OFFICER FOR 10 YEARS
AT SUFFOLK SUPERIOR
AND I SUPERVISED THE HOMELESS
COMMUNITY AND A LOT OF THE
HOMELESS COMMUNITY THAT WOULD
COME TO
IN FOR PROBATION DIDN'T HAVE ANY
I.D. AT ALL.

ALTHOUGH WHEN THEY DID GO TO THE
HOMELESS SHELTER, THE HOMELESS
SHELTER USUALLY,
I.D. TO THAT PERSON, BUT HAVING
SOME TYPE OF:

HELPFUL AND THAT WOULD
PERSON THE OPPORTUNITY TO ALMOST

GET BACK ON THEIR FEET AND GET INVOLVED IN DIFFERENT SERVICES AND PROGRAMS, BUT THEY DID NEED AN I.D. AND A LOT OF THE HOMELESS SHELTERS PROVIDED THAT WHICH I THINK WAS VERY HELPFUL AND I KNOW IN YOUR COMMENTS YOU HIGHLIGHTED THE HOMELESS COMMUNITY.

WHAT ARE SOME OF THE FEEDBACK THAT YOU'VE RECEIVED FROM THE VARIOUS HOMELESS SHELTERS IN BOSTON ON THIS PROGRAM?

>> TO BE HONEST, I WOULD HAVE TO RETURN TO SOME OF THE NOTES FROM OUR ORIGINAL STAKEHOLDER MEETINGS TO REALLY ACCURATELY ABOUT SPECIFICALLY THE RESPONSE FROM SHELTER PROVIDERS, FOR EXAMPLE, BUT I THINK FOR THE MOST PART PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS, BUT THE PROBLEM OF LACKING FORMAL IDENTIFICATION IS A PROBLEM THAT HAS EXISTED FOR A REALLY LONG TIME AND THERE HAVE BEEN -- THERE HAVE BEEN FOR DIFFERENT COMMUNITIES -- THERE HAVE BEEN ATTEMPTS TO SOLVE IT.

FOR YOUNG PEOPLE, FOR EXAMPLE, AND POTENTIALLY FOR PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS, BUT IF I'M REMEMBERING CORRECTLY FROM THOSE INITIAL MEETINGS WITH STAKEHOLDERS, SUPPORT FROM MUNICIPAL I.D. PROGRAM ASSUMING THE PROGRAM IS SAFE AND SECURE AND DOESN'T SERVE TO FURTHER STIGMATIZE POPULATIONS THAT ARE ALREADY MARGINALIZED, BUT THERE IS INTEREST AMONG THOSE PROVIDERS IN PROVIDING A FORM OF IDENTIFICATION FOR PEOPLE EXPERIENCING HOMELESSNESS WHO OTHERWISE DON'T HAVE THE OPPORTUNITY TO ACQUIRE THAT FORM OF IDENTIFICATION AND ARE AS A RESULT, FROM A LOT OF CITY SERVICES ACCESSING A LOT OF OPPORTUNITIES THAT BENEFICIAL TO THEIR HEALTH AND WELLBEING.

>> THANK YOU.

THAT'S ALL I HAVE.

ANY FINAL COMMENTS FROM
COUNCILOR WU OR COUNCILOR
FLAHERTY?

>> I JUST WANTED TO -- OUR
RESEARCH DIRECTOR FROM THE
COUNCIL OFFERED SOME SUGGESTIONS
AS WELL THAT WE SHOULD ENTER
INTO THE RECORD ABOUT MUNICIPAL
ID CARD COULD ALSO BE USED TO
ESTABLISH PARTNERSHIPS WITH
MERCHANTS OR BUSINESSES IN THE
CITY.

JUAN HAS SUGGESTED MOVIE
THEATERS, DUNKIN' DONUTS OR
OTHER BUSINESSES.

IF THERE'S SOME PROGRAM TO OFFER
COUPONS OR DISCOUNTS THAT
WOULD ALSO HELP NOT ONLY WITH
THE ROLL-OUT AND INTEREST IN THE
PROGRAM, BUT ALSO MAKING SURE
THERE'S A WIDE ENOUGH UPTAKE OF
IT, SO JUST ANOTHER
ADD TO THE MANY